Security Sector Reform in Lebanon
Case study: Women in the ISF

By

Christelle Samaha

A thesis
Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements
For the degree of Master of Arts in International Affairs

School of Arts and Sciences
January 2013
Thesis Proposal Form

Name of Student: Christelle Sumaha  
I.D. #: 200703779

Program / Department: International Affairs

On (dd/mm/yy): has presented a Thesis proposal entitled:

The Role of Women in the Internal Security Forces

in the presence of the Committee Members and Thesis Advisor:

Advisor: Dr. Jennifer Stute-Ouiss (Name and Signature)

Committee Member: Dr. Bassel Saloukh (Name and Signature)

Committee Member: Dr. Sami Baroué (Name and Signature)

Comments / Remarks / Conditions to Proposal Approval:

Overall concept good and good data; make sure to inject sufficient theory into your discussion.

Date: 14/6/13

Acknowledged by: [Signature]

cc: Department Chair
School Dean
Student
Thesis Advisor
Thesis Defense Result Form

Name of Student: Christelle Samaha  
ID: 200703379

Program / Department: International Affairs

Date of thesis defense: 31 January 2013

Thesis title: The Role of Women in the Internal Security Forces

Result of Thesis defense:
- Thesis was approved pending corrections. Passing grade to be granted upon review and approval by thesis advisor.
- Thesis is not approved. Grade NF is recorded.

Committee Members:
Advisor: Jennifer Skute, Quinn

Committee Member: Bassel Salloula

Committee Member: Omar Nashabii

Advisor's report on completion of corrections (if any):

Changes approved by thesis advisor: [Signature]

Date: 12 January 2013  
Acknowledged by: [Signature]

cc: Registrar, Dean, Chair, Thesis Advisor, Student
Thesis Approval Form

Student Name: __Christelle Samaha__________  ID #: __200703779______

Thesis Title: __"The Role of Women in the Internal Security Forces"__________

Program/Department: __International Affairs__________________________

School: __Arts and Sciences__________________________

Approved by:

Thesis Advisor: __Jennifer Skufa-Ouais, PhD__________________________

Committee Member: __Dr. Bassel Salloukh__________________________

Committee Member: __Dr. Omar Nashed__________________________

Date: __________31 January 2013________________________
LEBANESE AMERICAN UNIVERSITY NON-EXCLUSIVE DISTRIBUTION LICENSE

By signing and submitting this license, you (the author(s) or copyright owner) grants to Lebanese American University (LAU) the non-exclusive right to reproduce, translate (as defined below), and/or distribute your submission (including the abstract) worldwide in print and electronic format and in any medium, including but not limited to audio or video. You agree that LAU may, without changing the content, translate the submission to any medium or format for the purpose of preservation. You also agree that LAU may keep more than one copy of this submission for purposes of security, backup and preservation. You represent that the submission is your original work, and that you have the right to grant the rights contained in this license. You also represent that your submission does not, to the best of your knowledge, infringe upon anyone's copyright. If the submission contains material for which you do not hold copyright, you represent that you have obtained the unrestricted permission of the copyright owner to grant LAU the rights required by this license, and that such third-party owned material is clearly identified and acknowledged within the text or content of the submission. IF THE SUBMISSION IS BASED UPON WORK THAT HAS BEEN SPONSORED OR SUPPORTED BY AN AGENCY OR ORGANIZATION OTHER THAN LAU, YOU REPRESENT THAT YOU HAVE FULFILLED ANY RIGHT OF REVIEW OR OTHER OBLIGATIONS REQUIRED BY SUCH CONTRACT OR AGREEMENT. LAU will clearly identify your name(s) as the author(s) or owner(s) of the submission, and will not make any alteration, other than as allowed by this license, to your submission.

Name: Christelle Samaha
Signature: Date: 29/01/2013
PLAGIARISM POLICY COMPLIANCE STATEMENT

I certify that I have read and understood LAU’s Plagiarism Policy. I understand that failure to comply with this Policy can lead to academic and disciplinary actions against me.
This work is substantially my own, and to the extent that any part of this work is not my own I have indicated that by acknowledging its sources.

Name: Christelle Samaha

Signature:  Date: 29/01/2013
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

My thank you goes to those hands always ready to help, to every hastened step humoring my every need, to those eyes always reading my want.

Thank you Dr. Jennifer Skulte Ouaiss for being the driver of this thesis. I am also thankful to Dr. Bassel Salloukh and Dr. Omar Nashabe for taking part in the defense committee.

Thank you, Mirianne, for always believing in me and being the support I need.

Thank you Mirabelle, Sara, Mohammad and Rabie, you conspired beautifully in helping me finish my thesis.

Thank you for all of you who helped me gather the needed information or filled the questionnaires, you have turned my research into an adventure.

Finally a thank you to my family especially my lovely sister, you bared my sighs and rejoiced to my cries of victory. We did it
To the promising Internal Security Forces and the accomplished Women of my country
SECURITY SECTOR REFORM IN LEBANON
CASE STUDY: WOMEN IN THE ISF

By

Christelle Samaha

Abstract

This thesis highlights whether Lebanon is undergoing Security Sector Reform by examining the critical timing of Women’s recruitment in the Internal Security Forces. The statuses of the Lebanese women and the ISF have been maturing at their own pace due to the country’s unique nature. This law enforcement agency has recently witnessed change and improvement after being neglected for so many years. The wars and political allegiances have all delayed the ISF from the path of professionalism. Women’s presence in the ISF has long been limited to two members until 2011 where the doors for applicants have been opened. This decision is the most recent resolution taken after series of choices destined to strengthen the ISF. Lebanon is considered to be a post-conflict society marked by its unfortunate history. A diversified portfolio of literature defining Security Sector Reform (SSR) and its application is deeply discussed in order to establish a benchmark for Lebanon. In addition, Gender Sensitive Reform is defined on the premise that women’s and men’s socially constructed roles, behaviors, social positions, access to power and resources create gender specific vulnerabilities or gendered insecurities, some of which are particularly salient during and after conflict, because sexual and gender based violence may have been used as a weapon of war, and may continue at high levels when conflict is formally ended. This thesis explores the possibility of applying security sector reform to the ISF occurring changes. In addition to that several reasons can be determined for initiating Women’s recruitment. The foreign assistance program, the flaws in the system, success of previous experiences or the
political reasons behind the change, can all offer us an insight to determine the reasons of this critical timing. The prospects of this step seem promising on every level. The surveys conducted on the public and ISF members highlight a positive reaction to this new measure. The ISF is undergoing a change caused by several factors working together. Women recruitment could be considered as a double edge sword either driving the ISF forward or holding it back even more than the volatility of the political situation and internal problems.

Keywords: Women’s recruitment, Gender Sensitive Reform, Post-conflict society, Critical timing, Security sector reform.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I_INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1-6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Situating the thesis</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Research question</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Methodology</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Mapping the thesis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II_ Literature review:</td>
<td>7-29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 History of SSR</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 The contribution of the UN to SSR</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 SSR theories</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Reforming Lebanon- A post conflict society</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Gender sensitive reform and comparative study</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III_ Women in the ISF:</td>
<td>29-46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 History of the ISF</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 The current situation of Women in the ISF</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 The ISF’s transformation</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV_ Causes for the critical timing of the reform:</td>
<td>47-59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 The foreign assistance program</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Flaws in the system</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Success of previous experience</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.4 Political reasons behind the recruitment 58

V. Prospects 60-73

5.1 Prospects on the ISFs level 60
5.2 Prospects on the society level 68
5.3 Prospects on the government level 72

VI. Conclusion 74-77

6.1 General findings and conclusion 74
6.2 Is Lebanon undergoing SSR? 74
6.3 Future Prospects. 76

VIII. Bibliography 78

IX. Appendices 62-70

Appendix 1 62
Appendix 2 66
Appendix 3 70
Appendix 4 86
# LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Figure Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3.1</td>
<td>Organizational Structure of the ISF</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3.2</td>
<td>Cover of Women Police in 2010</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LISTS OF CHARTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Tablet Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 3.1</td>
<td>Applicant’s age</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3.2</td>
<td>Applicant’s casa of Origin</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.1</td>
<td>Total of classes taught by the American Mission</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.2</td>
<td>Total of donations made by the American mission</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.1</td>
<td>Response of ISF members interviewed</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.2</td>
<td>Public’s reaction</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Situating the thesis:

Lebanon is a country that distinguishes itself by a unique diversified identity. The location of the country in the Middle East contributed in forming Lebanon’s rich history. Its unique nature as a haven for 18 different sects constitutes its identity. The Arab influence combined with western values created a new mixture of ideals affecting the Lebanese society. History proved that the Lebanese politics has always been characterized by the division of its foreign allegiances. After gaining its independence in 1943, Lebanon’s security sector suffered from the political instability the country constantly faced. The Internal Security Forces was created in 1861 under the name of the Lebanese Gendarmerie. This security went through several changes reaching on the 12th of June 1959 by the decree NR 138, the establishment of the first directorate for the Internal Security Forces (ISF). The civil war and the constant conflicts led to the neglect of this institution. Later on during the Syrian tutelage phase, the ISF’s role was replaced by the Syrian army. The Ta’ef agreement was the first significant step affecting the ISF where several decisions were taken highlighted by the signing of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. The ISF’s number remained insufficient in order to accomplish their work. The ISF stayed in the shadow of the Lebanese Army that used to lead in all the security matters. The 2005 period was another important step triggered by the assassination of Prime Minister Hariri. The Syrian’s troop retreat from Lebanon and the general political situation marked a new era for the ISF. Before 2005, the ISF’s effective presence was practically inexistent. Some would interpret this shift as the first reel attempt for ISF reform. During this period the new recruitment opportunities, the foreign assistance programs and the work on the training material allowed the ISF the opportunity to develop their abilities. Women’s recruitment is the latest
improvement made to the ISF in order to be able to complete their job and modernize policing in Lebanon.

Women’s role in the Lebanese society is correlated to women’s role in the workforce. In other words women’s role is never stagnant; it follows a pace of its own. They say that the Lebanese woman is a contradiction of western and eastern values, this definition sheds a new light on her rocky road of evolution, where sometimes she assumes herself in all her success and brilliance while in a split of a second her status can be crushed by the archaic beliefs that still holds as pillars of this society. The contradiction of her success in certain fields (bank, judges, international organizations…) in contrast to her failures in others (politics and security) is still an important question to be answered. While this inconsistency accompanies her in her everyday life, the Lebanese woman has decided, even if delayed, to break yet another red line. She has finally caught up with other undeveloped and developed country and embrace the security field by enrolling in the biggest law enforcement agency in Lebanon which is the Internal Security Forces.

This step was considered a late decision in comparison to the other security forces in the country but none the less different in its nature. This important step marks the transition of women from desk job into the field work for the first time in the security sector.

1.2 Research question:

The main purpose of this thesis is to evaluate if Lebanon has embarked on the road of security sector reform by examining the case of Women’s recruitment in the ISF. What has led to the push to recruit women into the ISF? What are the factors that caused Lebanon’s delay from other countries? Women’s recruitment in the ISF is not considered a new measure. The lonely career of two female members started in 2001. Why did it take the ISF 11 years to pursue this decision? Why do women reach high rankings in other security entities in contrast to her shy existence in the ISF? During those 11 years what are the changes that the ISF underwent? The answer to these questions requires a detailed study of the security forces. The ISF history is an
essential key giving insight to a better grasp of its function. Lebanon’s situation cannot be separated from the ISF’s analysis due the intertwining of politics and security in the country. The ISF also suffers from internal problems that cripple any attempt for developments. Corruption, financial difficulties, lack of qualifications training and equipments makes any trial for change an endeavor to achieve. The constant rivalries between the security entities as well as the lack of cooperation between the donors are other factors fragilizing the ISF’s path of progress. By attempting to answer the research question, other questions are raised. Are the ISF initiatives leading Lebanon towards a fragmented SSR?

1.3 Methodology:

The ISF suffers from lack of research and information availability. Few studies and publications were conducted regarding the topic. The difficult system to access the ISF’s data is considered a disadvantage to pursue the topic. It is essential in order to be able to answer the research question to refer to several methods of gathering information. The advantage I hold for writing this thesis is my personal experience working with the ISF for 3 years. I had the lucky opportunity to witness and participate in the women’s and men’s recruitment and training. This unique experience allowed me a reel insight on the ISF mechanism and presented me with the opportunity to observe the situation from an insider’s point of view.

A series of interviews were necessary in order to answer several problematic questions. The first interview was conducted with the General Commander Riffi on March 17th 2011. This interview occurred after the recruitment phase started. The purpose of the interview is to determine the General Directorate plans regarding women in the force. An interview was conducted before the actual training started with the General Abboud in charge of the logistics in the ISF. The second Interview was conducted with Minister Baroud on the 13th of November 2012. He was the Minister of Interior when the recruitment process started thus offering a better grasp on the decision making process. Another interview was conducted with Captain Dyala Mehtar (November 26, 2012) that was directly involved in all the women recruitment measures as well as Major Suzan el Hajj (November 24, 2012) that headed one of the female’s academies. The unique experience of those distinguished
officers played an essential part in women recruitment. An interview was also conducted with the senior advisor of the UK’s implementing agency on the 16th of January 2013. M. Mark Mouawad from the Northern Ireland Co-Operation Overseas was an asset explaining the mechanism of the UK’s assistance program. The last interview was conducted with M. Riccardo Chelleri the SAROL project manager as well as M. Andre Deutscher the chief technical adviser. This interview took place April fourth 2013.

The literature review was essential in order to conduct the thesis. A wide portfolio of publications was available regarding the security sector reform and gender sensitive reform in contrary to the Lebanese security sector situation. The detailed explanation of security sector mechanism as well as definitions is fundamental step to be able to later on evaluate if Lebanon is undergoing Security Sector Reform. The general guidelines, obstacles and functions are the main keys offering us the insight to SSR. The analysis will also contain a comparative study with Liberia, another post-conflict society. The main analysis was based on three studies conducted by Dr. Nashabe, Dr. Sayegh, and Dr. Belloncle. These three studies explained the Lebanese security situation offering the platform for the thesis analysis.

The topic required more information that led to the establishment of three sets of questionnaires in order to evaluate the prospects regarding this step. A quantitative approach helps evaluate the general response towards women’s recruitment. The first questionnaire was destined to 80 different members for the ISF in order to analyze the level of acceptance and evaluation of this measure. The second questionnaire was designed for the training team heading the female training classes evaluating the training process. The third questionnaire was meant to a random sample for the Lebanese society analyzing their reaction to women presence in the ISF.

1.4 Mapping the thesis

The thesis is made up of six chapters. The next chapter consists of the literature review. The chapter first offers an explanation of SSR history explaining its creation leading to its modern functions. The insight of several approaches attempting to define SSR is another fundamental step in the literature review chapter. In addition the chapter elaborates the UN’s contribution to SSR through a model for
reforming the security sector in a post conflict society. The model can be used as a benchmark in order to evaluate Lebanon’s position in terms of Security sector Reform. Furthermore the thesis tackles several SSR theories treated by theme. In a second level the chapter elaborates the situation of the Lebanese security sector in terms of reform. This part is based on three fundamental studies entitled: “Fixing Broken Windows”, “The Arab Reform Initiative Security Sector Reform in Lebanon Internal Security Forces and General Security” and “Prospects of SSR in Lebanon”. Women recruitment in the ISF could be evaluated as a gender sensitive reform. The last part of this chapter offers an explanation regarding gender sensitive policing as well as a comparative study with Liberia, another post-conflict society.

The third chapter offers an insight regarding the ISF. It presents a brief historical overview leading to women’s recruitment in the force. This chapter grants an essential detailed descriptive approach regarding this new step. Women’s in the ISF is currently an ongoing step making the information very recent and valuable.

Chapter four elaborates the possible answer to the research question. It presents four interpretations justifying the critical timing of the reform. The foreign assistance programs, the flaws in the system, the success of previous experiences or political reasons are discussed in details clarifying the reasons behind the change. Chapter six interprets the prospects of this step adopted by the ISF. It offers an analysis to the response towards women in the ISF. It is interpreted on the ISF, society and governmental level in order to have a complete analysis regarding the prospects.

The last chapter presents general conclusions and findings. It relates the overall analysis for SSR and women in the ISF. It also presents the author’s evaluation and interpretation of unanswered questions.
CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW

Security sector reform (SSR) is considered to be a new rising concept in the modern world. After the cold war, the notion of security sector reform emerged. Several definitions were used in an attempt to define this new phenomenon giving us a diversified insight regarding the topic. The security sector has gone a long way in the path of change, witnessing evolution and new specifications that meets the requirement of the recent world dynamics. It is considered a new approach of security complementing the political and economic functions of any country.

One of the definitions presented by Yasutomi and Carmans states that SSR can be defined as a transformation of “the security institutions so that they can play an effective, legitimate and democratically accountable role in providing external and internal security for citizens” (Yasutomi and Carmans, 2007). The United Nations Security Council is a key player contributing in the implementation of SSR. The UN believes that SSR is “critical to the consolidation of peace and stability, promoting poverty reduction, rule of law and good governance, extending legitimate state authority, and preventing countries from relapsing into conflict”(Bastick, 2007, p. 1).

This chapter is the basis of the thesis structure. It offers us an insight about the history of SSR followed by a multitude of theories regarding the mechanism of SSR and its prospects. In addition, the UN plays an important part in SSR allowing us an approach for reference model used as a benchmark for comparison to the Lebanese case. The second part of the chapter will transition to the Lebanese unique case. The information is very scarce leaving the analyses to three authors discussing the exceptional case of the country. The last part of the chapter tackles specifically gender sensitive police system in order to integrate this information later on to the Lebanese case study of women in the ISF.
2.1 History of SSR:

Nicole Ball is one of the authors that exhaustively studied the concept of security sector reform allowing us a deeper grasp the concept. “The evolution of the Security Sector Reform Agenda”, Ball narrates the development of the security sector since the Post Cold War period. The major powers of the East and West during that period had a different understanding of security assistance. The only purpose of aid and assistance was to form key allies especially with militarized governments. This trend led to “Security for the elite and regime flourished at the expense of the security for citizens, communities and often the state” (Ball, 1981).

The Post cold war period was characterized by the importance of the military involvement in politics. “In general, comparatively little effort was made to understand the complex political, social and economic dynamics that shaped the relationships between civilians and security elites; this affected the capacity of states to provide the broad-based security their populations required for sustainable political and socio-economic development” (Ball, 1981; Ball and Hendrickson, 2009). The 1980’s period was marked by the fall of several military and authoritarian regimes. A new era started for the security sector shaped by participatory government and new literature paving the way for the 1990’s and the rise of SSR.

“The concept of security sector reform has become increasingly popular since it was put forward to a larger public in a speech by Clare Short, the then United Kingdom Minister for International Development, in London in 1998” (Short & Ball, 1999). SSR was primarily adapted by the UK Department for International Development (DFID) after the 1997’s election of the Labor Party. “By early 1999, DFID has produced a policy note on poverty and the security sector that outlined the conditions under which development assistance could be used to engage SSR and specific criteria for DFID” (DFID & Short, 1999). The first policy adopted did not include the police regular law enforcement activities. Experience led the British government to develop the notion of security sector in order to include large portions of the justice system. The UK’s broadened their experience to larger horizon affecting the international community. In other words, the UK is the main contributor of SSR and a major proponent of the strategic thinking that emerged over the last
decade through The Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development, Development Assistance Committee’s “OECD DAC”.

On another level, “The breakup of the bipolar world also created space for issues such as governance, poverty reduction and conflict prevention to enter the development and security assistance agendas of OECD countries” (Ball, 2010). After the fall of the Soviet Union and the end of the bipolar world, SSR was built by the inputs of previous times and shifted towards a more political liberalization approach. Ball explains in her study entitled “the evolution of the security sector reform agenda” that the post cold war period was marked by changes in the geopolitical landscape provided for the integration of security into political and economic development, the reform of public institutions and the promotion of efforts elite attitudes and behaviors in both developing and transition countries. The end of the 1990’s was marked by governance as a main focus for donor countries, opening the door for discussions of security sector governance and collaboration with security actor. It was very clear that the 90’s was a real transitional period for security. “ The concept of SSR was also influenced by the broader “human security” agenda, which is based on two key ideas: first, that the protection of individuals is critical to both national and international security; and second, that the security conditions required by people for their development are not limited to traditional matters such as national defense and law and order, but rather incorporate broader political, economic and social issues that ensure a life free from risk and ill-being” (Cawthra, 1997, p. 7-26). The mid 1990’s witnessed an important event marking the security sector where NATO and the European Union made democratic civil-military relations a clause for membership. The work on democratic civil-military relations in the transition countries of Eastern Europe and the Soviet Union became a priority and even an incentive. “For their part, NATO and EU members had an incentive to develop the capacity to support efforts that strengthened the accountability of the civil authorities to manage the defense sector” (Hendrickson and Karkozka, 2002). The role of donors was secondary in transitional countries where politics and security were considered the main key players.

The DAC reached an agreement on a policy statement in 2004. The definition states “The transformation of the “security system” which includes all the actors, their roles, responsibilities and actions working together to manage and operate the
system in a manner that is more consistent with democratic norms and sound principles of good governance” (OECD, 2004).

The DAC’s agenda is built on four main pillars:

- Develop a clear institutional framework for providing security that integrates security and development policy and includes all relevant actors and focuses on the vulnerable, such as women, children and minority groups.
- Strengthen the governance and oversight of security institutions
- Build capable and professional security forces that are accountable to civil authorities and open to dialogue with civil society organizations.
- Promote the sustainability of justice and security service delivery.

The OECD DAC played a fundamental part in attempting to specifically define SSR as well as define its structure. Theoretically, the definitions and actions plans of SSR remain broad. On the practical level, several powerful countries adopted SSR and committed to the change. For instance, the UK had undertaken several activities in the name of SSR. The US also committed to SSR through several initiatives like the restructuring of the Liberian army and ministry of defense. In addition, the UN became a key player reinforcing SSR by adopting peace support missions with SSR mandates.

2.2 The contribution of the United Nations to SSR:

The world has witnessed an increased demand for Security Sector Reform (SSR) due to the drastic change in the international security landscape. “The link between and efficient and accountable security sector and development has become widely acknowledge” (UN report, 2008: p1). SSR has become essential in promoting peace and stability. Security sector reform is not a new activity for the UN. The first assistance was offered to Namibia in 1989 where the UN supported national authorities in reforming the armed forces and building a new national army. The UN developed a variety of expertise to assist countries in implementing SSR. The lack of a common framework and general strategy led the UN to restructure and redefine its measure. The organization’s power extends limited institutional capacities and structures at headquarters and guidance to field work. After the request of country members through the General Assembly and the Security Council,
the United Nations embarked on the path of developing a consistent and comprehensive approach. In 2008 the secretary general published a report entitled “Securing Peace and Development: the role of the United Nations in supporting Security Sector Reform” by Mustapha S. Adib (2008). This report was evaluated as a major stepping stone for the SSR international improvement. The report highlights the scope of the security sector as well as the absence of a single security model. It is essential to define the components of the security sector. The broad misconception of defining the actors of the security sector only includes the military as well as the police. The security sector includes other than the official security management, the parliament, civil society bodies and informal security organizations. The report also sheds light on the uniqueness of each country formed by history, culture, sects… In other terms, the security sector reform should be tailored to each country’s need. In the report, the secretary-general’s recognizes that effective and accountable security sectors have a number of common features:

- A legal and/or constitutional framework
- An institutionalized system of governance and management
- Mechanism for interaction among security actors
- A culture of service

In other words, the new definition of SSR includes “a process of assessment, review and implementation as well as monitoring and evaluation led by national authorities that has as its goals the enhancement of effective and accountable security for the State and its peoples without discrimination and with full respect for human rights and the rule of law” (UN, 2008, para. 17).

According to the 2008 UN study, “Security Peace and Development: The role of the United Nations in Supporting Sector reform,” (p.2, sec 2.1) the SSR is based on 10 pillars. These set are a broad guideline to follow when committing to SSR:

- The goal of the UN in SSR is to support states and societies in developing effective, inclusive and accountable security institutions, so as to contribute to international peace and security, sustainable development and the enjoyment of human rights by all.
SSR should be undertaken on the basis of a national decision, a Security Council mandate and/ or a General Assembly resolution, the Charter of the United Nations and human rights laws and standards.

In order to be successful and sustainable, support in the area of SSR must be anchored on national ownership and the commitment of involved states and societies.

A UN approach to SSR must be flexible and tailored to the country, region and/or specific environment in which reform is taking place, as well as to the different needs of all stakeholders.

A UN approach to SSR must be gender-sensitive through ought its planning, design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation phases. It must also include the reform of recruitment processes and improvement in the delivery of security services to address and prevent sexual and gender-based violence.

A SSR framework is essential in the planning and implementation of post-conflict activities. Ideally, SSR should begin at the outset of a peace process and should be incorporated into early recovery and development strategies.

A clearly defined strategy, including the identifications of priorities, indicative timelines and partnerships, is required for the implementation of a SSR process.

The effectiveness of international support for SSR will be shaped by the integrity of motive, the level of accountability and the amount of resources provided.

Coordination of national and international partner’s efforts is essential. Lead national entities and a designated international counterpart should be identified wherever possible.

Monitoring and regular evaluation against established principles and specific benchmarks are essential to track and maintain progress in SSR.

“Preventive actions are always much more cost-effective than corrective ones” (UN, 2008). In other words, the study shows that several factors can undermine SSR. A mixture of several factors like insecurity and violence can undermine SSR. This is why it more efficient to deal with these matters preemptively.

In addition, the report shows that the world is facing two new threats: terror and cyber-crimes. In order to deal with the recurrent problems, a country faces and the constant new threat rising induced by globalization, the security sector must
evolve in order to deal with new challenges. The natures of the new threats are mostly based on terrorism and cyber crimes. Globalization is contributing in promoting the threats and giving them easier access to the interconnected world. The security sector requires changes and reform in order to keep up with the new world. “The conception of security which must evolve as the globalization of security must confront the globalization of threats, in particular the so-called “internationalization” of jihad and cyber-criminality” (UN, 2008, p. 1).

Cyber-crimes are increasingly key tools for organized crime. The impact of this threat affects politics, economics, and ideological ideas. The UN has implemented a unit called “Information and Strategic Analysis Secretariat” in order to allow for strategic planning and early response. In this study, Mustapha explains the negative impact of insecurity on the recovery of a post-conflict society and prevents development. “SSR is a crucial step of all peace-keeping operations with tremendous influence upon the future of the country in terms of Democracy, Security, and Economy, thus on its overall stability” (UN, 2008, p. 2).

In order to reach a successful SSR, gender integration should play an important role in the process.

“Rather than an exercise on political correctness, the integration of gender issues is being recognized as a key to operational effectiveness, local ownership and strengthened oversight. For example, increasing the recruitment of female staff, preventing human rights violations and collaborating with women’s organizations contributes in to creating efficient, accountable and participatory security sector, which responds to the specific needs of men, women, girls and boys” (UN, 2008, p. 4).

Gender sensitive reform decreases gender-based violence especially towards women and girls as well as it increases the level of respect for human rights. Furthermore, when women are in the force, the whole population is represented, thus giving the police more credibility. In fact, the ratio of credibility increased when Nicaragua accounted for 26% female personnel.

The UN plays an important part in SSR but still a limited one with the country of need. Several limitations burden to attempt of reform. “SSR is a critical component of conflict prevention, stabilization and peace building agendas. It is also
both an entry point for and an outcome of good governance. Although the organization has been assisting national authorities in this area for decades, support has been ad hoc and, at times, incoherent.” (Ebo and Powell, 2010). The UN’s major contribution was through the report published in 2008 that allowed for the first time a defined guideline for SSR. Several unit establishments are considered to be other achievement but held back by several limitations.

After presenting UN general standards’ regarding SSR, it is essential to have a deeper grasp of security sector reform. Many scholars have study this rising phenomena leading to a deeper understanding of the security sector.

2.3 SSR theories:

A much diversified portfolio of SSR theories exists. It is considered a new concept that has been vastly interpreted by scholars. This part of the literature review offers us a sample of theories interpreting SSR and its functioning mechanisms. This part will tackle 4 part of SSR: defining SSR in a post conflict society, the importance of donor coherence, the application of SSR and the obstacles preventing its proper application.

Bridging the gap between theory and application is very difficult when it comes to the Security sector. The customized case of each country makes the application of SSR unique and intricate to achieve.

A country that witnessed wars and conflicts has suffered greatly especially on the security level. The country’s sovereignty could have been violated on an internal level as well international one or even both. The reconstruction of a reel state and the reel extension of the rule of a law are considered an endeavor to achieve. “Many policy makers continue to assume that when armed conflict comes to an end, safety and security will somehow naturally improve” (Muggah, 2009). Security sector reform in a post conflict society is a delicate matter that can be manipulated into a political tool driving the country in different directions. The initiative to undertake SSR can be driven by several factors; the country’s will to overcome war, militias or international assistance applied through a donor assistance program. “In many post-conflict countries of the world, security sector reform has been donor driven. Donors have insisted on and assisted in security sector reform projects and made such
programmes a condition of their post-conflict assistance” (Diamint, 2002). Scholar’s studies explain about different trends of SSR. It has been stated that there is the American approach as well as the European approach to SSR. Jake Sherman explains in his study entitled “The global war on terrorism and its implications for US security sector reform support”, the US application of SSR. SSR discourse emerged in the United States in the narrow window between the end of the Cold War and the beginning of the war on terror. “The war on terror” marked by the September 11 attacks altered the US motives in applying SSR worldwide. It was clear on the American agenda that fighting terrorism is a fundamental motive to apply SSR that aims to help countries achieve a democratic system. On the other hand Europe witnessed the rise of the security sector at the end of the Cold War. Security sector reform was focused on the security of the individual rather than the state. “By the end of the 1990’s war, war and conflict had become mainstream in development discourse” (Duffield, 2001). The UK’s DFIC played a fundamental role in influencing EU and UN decisions and even leading the creation of the OECD DAC. “This process has been characterized as much by developmentalization of the security agenda as the other way around, as evidence by the holistic approach and governance focus of SSR, whereby security is regarded as provided by a system of actors within a framework of democratic accountability” (Albrecht, Stepputat and Andersen, 2010).

Some countries have a more complex internal system than others. For instance, Lebanon is the target of several different donors as suffers greatly from internal fragmentations. Lebanon is a target for donor driven reform. Donor coordination is an essential pillar for successful SSR. “Although local ownership of SSR processes is the declared objective of all SSR effort, particularly in post conflict settings international donors play crucial roles in initiating and implementing reforms. While donor aid can be crucial in providing opportunities for conducting SSR, poor donor coordination prevents the pursuit of a common approach to SSR” (Shnabel & Born, 2010). Previously, the OECD and its member states highlighted the importance of a “holistic” and integrated approach as well as the importance of the governance dimension of security sector reform. “There are significant differences in donor approaches and terminology” (Wulf, 2002). The OECD countries face major problems the complex relations of development, security,
foreign policy actors as well as defense. For instance, Wulf explains in his study “Security sector reform in developing and transitional countries” that the World Bank is rather reserved about working closely with the military due to its mandate of promoting transparency and management in the security sector.

Reforming the security sector faces several obstacles determined in several different studies. Schnabel and Born determined in their study entitled “Security sector reform: narrowing the gap between theory and practice” several obstacles and challenges reducing SSR’s efficacy”

- The impact of armed conflict on SSR
- The political nature of SSR
- Lack of accountability
- Lack of donor coordination
- Political, ideological and financial challenges
- Ethical challenges
- Unintended consequences of SSR
- Practical difficulties facing SSR practitioners

Wulf highlights the impact of fund availability. He believes that financial means are a major key player improving or obstructing the impact of SSR. “Most donors are quick to embrace the paradigm of security sector reform but slow to implement it. In contrast, many have quickly promoted the US “war on terrorism”. This is the best illustrated by the enormous difference in financial resources available to the two policies. Resources for security sector reform projects are still scarce among most donors” (Wulf, 2002). After the September 11 attack, funds have suddenly increased for key developing and transitional countries. Wulf elaborates by explaining the need of the security sector to work with the right partners, benefit from donor policy coherence and selecting in the light of scare funds. The change in the security sector approach leads to the inclusion of economic cooperation project such as poverty reduction, crisis prevention, peacekeeping, disarmament, demobilization and reintegration, demining, assistance to strengthen human rights… “A range of governments are grafting security and justice provisions into national development frameworks. For example, poverty reduction strategies routinely feature analogues priorities. As important as these processes may be, they are often overtaken by events
on the ground including precipitous declines in security” (Downes and Muggah, 2002). The new concept of security sector evolved from the traditional assistance to the military and the police adding the new economic factors.

In order to apply an effective SSR tailored to each country’s needs, several studies presented recommendation in order to reach a successful outcome. Nicole Ball believes that donors should follow these recommendations:

- All support should be based on the understanding that a security sector that is accountable to civil authorities and ordinary people is structured to meet threats to individuals, their communities and their country, and is affordable, promoting not only the security of the country in question, but also the security of the region in which it is located and that of the international community.
- All support should be based on a solid understanding of security needs at the individual, sub national and national level.
- All support should be based on local demand
- External factors should accept that locally conceived and driven reform processes will take time and require an iterative approach.

Security sector reform is a complex process that requires a deep study of the country in conflict. The absence of a unified approach leaves SSR in a delicate situation. The studies show different approaches for SSR that generally converge to the same main ideas. Lebanon’s history dictates that the country is considered a post conflict society. The security sector has suffered greatly in this nation. The need for a security sector reform is essential in order to reach a strong nation built on the power of its institutions.

2.4 Reforming Lebanon—a post conflict society:

After the civil war and the constant political instability leading to internal conflict, Lebanon’s case calls out for SSR. The several studies conducted will allow us to evaluate if Lebanon is in the process of undergoing SSR.

Few authors have discussed the unique case of the security sector in Lebanon. Yezid Sayegh in his study “Fixing Broken Windows” (2009) discusses the ISF’s development and focuses on the US and European Union’s intervention. This study
offers a political insight to how reform has been practiced as well as how foreign assistance affects security sector reform while narrating the reality of the ISF situation. As for Nashabe (2009), he discusses the case of the ISF and General Security in his paper, “Security Sector Reform in Lebanon”. Edouard Belloncle (2006) also conducted a study specifically related to Lebanon. “Prospects of SSR in Lebanon” is a detailed security study explaining the possibility of SSR in the country. These three studies will allow us a deeper understanding of the Lebanese security sector highlighting weakness facing this post conflict society.

Sayegh believes that Lebanon has a relatively developed security sector in terms of formal legal framework and institutions, established chain of command, and subordination to civilian government. But the reality is different because the security sector still suffers from the legacy of the 15 years of civil war that ended 1990 and another 15 years of Syrian domination. “Despite the departure of Syrian troops in April 2005, the sector continues to suffer command and organizational weaknesses due to the pull of political, sectarian, and regional loyalties and various services report to different constitutional authorities” (Sayegh, 2009, sec. 9).

In his study, Sayegh explains that Lebanon is a country that emerged from a conflict with a deeply fractured state as well as divided society along with deep disagreement of what national interest is. He sees that Lebanon, Palestine and Yemen are all fractured and highly divided societies but at the same time different in their unique way. “Struggles for control over the security sector are endemic, with weak or fragmentary legal frameworks and decision-making structures that are opaque or of contested constitutionality” (Sayegh, 2009, p. 1). This study explains that Lebanon is in need of security institutions responding to democratically elected civilian leaders. But the US and European assistance programs first focused their help on military training and equipment targeted toward counterterrorist capabilities. The USA and European governments answer all the security problems by applying the ‘fix the broken windows’ theory in a simplified way: ‘fix what we can’ theory. The broken windows theory is a respected criminology theory. It states: “Consider a building with a few broken windows. If the windows are not repaired, the tendency is for vandals to break a few more windows. Eventually, they may even break into the building, and if it's unoccupied, perhaps become squatters or light fires inside. Or consider a sidewalk. Some litter accumulates. Soon, more litter accumulates.
Eventually, people even start leaving bags of trash from take-out restaurants there or breaking into cars”. The application of theory is customized to Lebanon according to Sayegh in order to fit the security framework.

“Fixing Broken Windows” highlights the vulnerability of the Lebanese case. “The sectarian and political struggle for control over the security sector is compounded by the presence of dual military forces in Lebanon resulting from the exemption of Hizbollah from the disarming and disbanding of the militias in the early 1990’s” (Sayegh, 2009, sec. 10). This duality creates impediments for the reform initiative. According to Sayegh’s study, the May 2008 crisis, during which the Lebanese opposition led by Hizbollah took control of the western half of the capital created a real schism in the country highlighting the fragility of the security sector. The country was paralyzed; the Army and ISF remained on the sidelines fearing a splintering of their institutions similar to what happened during the civil war. Even the Higher Defense Council and Central Security Council were unable to make or implement any decisions. The country was also weak after having undergone the 2006 war as well the 2008 crisis. The US and European administrations then realized then that the Lebanese security sector is under-resourced and underequipped.

“The counterterrorism purpose of US security assistance to Lebanon was made explicit in 2006. Since then, support for the ARMY and ISF has fluctuated in the line with their perceived loyalty to the government and opposition” (Sayegh, 2009, sec. 26). The Army benefits from 70% of the assistance as for the ISF the benefits are limited to 30%. During the events of Nahr el Bared, the US supplied the Army with arms and munitions. Furthermore, the war led the US to believe that the Army intelligence was closely involved with Hezbollah. This situation led the US to shift their focus on the ISF’s intelligence due to their closeness to the Hariri family. The USA’s position of supporting the 14 March government and the disarmament of Hezbollah made the security sector the object of a war. The USA and European assistance was considered as a very political initiative that led to national schism. In conclusion, Sayegh believes that due to the highly politicized situation on a local or international level, it is impossible for Lebanon to undergo any true security reform.
Nashabe’s approach to the Lebanese security sector is different. As mentioned in the previous chapter, the situation of the ISF is defined by several factors. “The Arab Reform Initiative Security Sector Reform in Lebanon Internal Security Forces and General Security” explains the history of the ISF and the major factors affecting its workings. Lebanon, once the tourist haven of the Middle East, was transformed in the 1960’s into a place of war and disputes. Nashabe believes that the first attempt for a reform occurred in 1990’s when peace was restored and a central government of national reconciliation was formed with Syrian, Saudi, French, and American involvement. The Taef agreement was considered constitutional reform covering major matters including the ISF. The adoption of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights was an important decision living the country forward as well as affecting ISF’s rules and treatments. After the Syrian troops’ retreat following the murder of Prime Minister Hariri, an inadequate attempt for a reform occurred, according to Nashabe.

“From 1990 until today several attempts were made to improve the security institutions in Lebanon, and although some progress was noted, especially in the first half of the 1990’s, numerous flaws remain noticeable. Five main flaws are identified” (Nashabe, 2009). The first flaw is that the political and financial corruption, are a great barrier facing the security sector’s evolution. The post war economic situation was very difficult leading to significant financial difficulties that created more corruption. The “wasta” concept is known to the security sector especially for the ISF and the General Security. The “wasta” states that a person benefits from connections and influential powers that allow him to profit from privileges. The concept has been transformed into a more legal phenomenon entitled “Bakhshish” or “iqramia” that can be defined as the legitimate tip presented in counterpart of the hard work presented. Nashabe elaborates that high ranking officers in the security sector are prone to favoritism for religious, political, and sectarian reasons. The second flaw is inadequate staff development. The officers appointed in specific functions lack sufficient knowledge and skills. “Lack of professionalism is especially noticeable when reading investigative reports which are handwritten in an untailored style. Investigative methods are primitive and inefficient, thus investigators tend to use violence during suspect questioning” (Nashabe, 2009, p. 2).
The third flaw is considered a major crippling factor for any attempt to progress positively. Insufficient and unsuitable equipment is also a problem facing the ISF and GS. Stations lack the basics to be able to perform proper law enforcement. Computers, photocopiers, and decent filing system are very scarcely found in the ISF’s stations. The questioning room is mostly unavailable as well as detention facilities few and in poor conditions. Police cars are not equipped properly in order to detain prisoners. All these obstacles make effective policing difficult to realize.

Rivalry and lack of coordination is the fourth challenge according to Nashabe’s study. It was in 2005 that the ISF witnessed the creation of the intelligence services. The rivalry between the ARMY and ISF became more accentuated especially on the intelligence service level. The division of the high ranking security positions is purely sectarian. “The ISF chief is [a] Sunni Muslim closely connected to the Sunni Prime Minister; the GS chief is Chiite Muslim or Maronite Christian closely connected to the President. As for the State Security, although it is officially under the authority of the Prime Minister, it is supposedly closely connected to Muslim Chiite speaker of the Parliament (Nashabe, 2009, p. 3).

The last challenge is the outdated regulations and organization. This situation creates a lot of barriers to the ISFs proper functioning. For instance, the promotion in the ISF is only related to seniority and not merit. A lot of measures might lead to conflict of interest. After presenting the major challenges obstructing the ISF proper functioning, Nashabe proposes five recommendations for reform: demilitarization, priority systematic accountability, promoting alternative incentives, field specialization, and equal opportunities. Nashabe believes that in order for the ISF to advance and overcome the major flaws in its system, those measures should be applied.

The third contribution to this discussion that is important to include is the work done by Edouard Belloncle (2006), who conducted a detailed study of the Lebanese security sector in order to evaluate the prospects of SSR in Lebanon. He believes that the Middle East is undoubtedly the most understudied area in the SSR literature. “The strategic evolution, as well as the rise of internal and external pressure on the Arab regimes may encourage the potential of SSR to shape the
Middle East’s democratic reform discourse and become a “nascent debate” in the region” (p. 2). Belloncle explains that experience has shown that SSR programmes have a superior chance to be successfully implemented in cases in which the recipient country is going through a process of domestic change. Lebanon witnessed in 2005 the assassination of Prime Minister Hariri followed by massive popular demonstration. The “Cedar Revolution” in cooperation with international politics, led to the withdrawal of Syrian troops from Lebanon. The UN investigation commission proved the link the situation in Lebanon to the increasing pressure on Syria due to the UN resolution 1559. The resolution consists of “all remaining foreign forces to withdraw from Lebanon and the disbanding and disarmament of all Lebanese and non-Lebanese militias” (UN resolution 1559). Resolution 1559 was proposed by France and the US and was voted by the Security Council in September 2004.

Belloncle believes that three major steps should be taken in regarding the security sector:

1) The Lebanese leaders must agree to continue the reconstruction of the army and spread its authority throughout the territory, in line with the UN Resolution 1701

2) Create a unified police mission that clearly defines its duties and completely break the concept of being a military auxiliary.

3) The Intelligence services must redefine their mission and lose the old habits gained during the Syrian tutelage of controlling the politics.

Lebanon’s delicate situation after the 2006 war and the internal armed clashes highlights the fragility of its security sector. Those three recommendations regarding each security institution is necessary in order to reach a proper security sector.

According to Belloncle (p. 7), “the ISF has been the most neglected security agency during the first 30 years of independence and the Syrian tutelage”. He believes that habitually the army had the role of policing and maintaining internal order. He adds that the nature of the crimes that police should deal with were almost inexistent during the Syrian terror period. A strong policing system requires the collaboration of several institutions like the Immigration Department and the Department of Justice and many others. These conditions were unacceptable during Syrian tutelage because it made it harder for the Syrians to control the situation in
Lebanon. The impact of the Syrian era was very broad on the Lebanese army. Syria preached about the weaknesses of the Lebanese army in order to demoralize the morale and adjourn the ability of the army to take over. This doctrine was clear in 2000 after the withdrawal of Israel from the South when Syria declined the deployment of the Lebanese army there. The Taef agreement stated the increase of the number of the ISF and the empowerment of police missions. Unfortunately, these requirements were never fulfilled. Belloncle explains that the series of assassinations that occurred in 2005 showed the need for the ISF to have scientific equipment and expertise in order to conduct the crime investigation. Since 2005 the ISF has worked hand in hand with western and Arab countries in order to develop the abilities and training of its members. “Officially, to achieve its anti-terrorism mission, the ISF recently created its own Intelligence service called Bureau d’Information (BI). This agency, which already houses 600 personnel and will soon have 1000 also suffers from significant technical problems, is politically sensitive, and risks overlapping with the numerous Intelligence services operating across the country” (Belloncle 2006, p. 9).

Belloncle further explains the impediments for SSR and the impact of internal and external factors. He believes “that the society and political communalism in Lebanon have not yet created the conditions for the development of a common national identity in line with the European nation-state from which the concept of SSR is drawn” (p. 1). An SSR initiative needs political stability and security. He concludes by adding “while domestic reforms are largely and necessarily in the Lebanese’s hands, the international community can and must act on Lebanese external environment to encourage and facilitate the implementation of SSR in the country. This requires acknowledgment of Lebanon’s need for external security” (Belloncle, 2006, p. 1).

In order for any SSR attempt to be successful, it should have a profound understanding of the communities’ interest and fear in order to reach a consensus on security reform. It should be noted that SSR is a difficult, long and very expensive process. An extensive study of the country’s characteristics, entry points and impediments to the reform should be conducted. “An SSR cannot be limited to the restructuring of normative and systematic mechanisms but will eventually involve a shift in fundamental values” (Belloncle, 2006, p. 11).
Belloncle concludes in his study that the “Cedar Revolution” is a definite step towards independence and democracy. “Engaged in the reorganization of the security sector, the Lebanese government could benefit from SSR concepts. Indeed, by moving away from militaristic considerations and adopting a holistic approach, the SSR concept seems suitable and relevant to the overall reconstruction of the Lebanese security apparatus and to the issue of the reintegration of the Lebanese and not Lebanese militias such as Hezbollah within the regular forces” (Belloncle, 2006, p. 18)

These three authors offered different insights into the Lebanese security sector and specifically to the ISF. In this section we have seen many theories applied to the Lebanese case. These studies have presented to us the impediments of the security sector as well as the propositions in order to reach the possibility of a security sector reform. From the security sector, we move now to a close up on the gender sensitive reform. Since Lebanon initiated the recruitment of women, will it lead to a gender sensitive reform?

2.5 Gender sensitive reform and comparative study:

“Gender sensitive police reform (GSPR) is based on the premise that women’s and men’s socially constructed roles, behaviors, social positions, access to power and resources create gender specific vulnerabilities or gendered insecurities, some of which are particularly salient during and after conflict, because sexual and gender based violence may have been used as a weapon of war, and may continue at high levels when conflict is formally ended. GSPR therefore applies a gender based violence may have been used as a weapon of war, and may continue at high level when conflict is formally ended” (UNIFEM, 2007, p. 3).

Significant research points to successful GSPR leading to better prevention and response to specific security needs of men, boys, women, and girls. “GSPR should also contribute towards building police institutions which are non-discriminatory, reflective of the diversity of citizens and accountable to the population at large. As such, police services will better fulfill the police’s essential mandate of upholding the
rule of law” (UNIFEM, 2007, p. 3). In a post-conflict society’s women should be protected by the law as well as benefit from their human rights to gender equality. The Security Council Resolution 1325 and the Committee on the Elimination of discrimination against women (CEDAW) guarantee a global legal and normative authority for the requirement that police reform incorporates all measures necessary to guarantee women their rights. Theoretically speaking in a post conflict society, a profound gender bias in the legal system exists. A systematic abuse of women rights is not usually investigated or even prevented by the police. Furthermore, “abuses of women bodies and property particularly when perpetrated by a male relative in the domestic arena may be seen as a private matter, not for police attention. Breaking the silence, including through legal reform to bring national laws up to international human rights standards is therefore an essential first step towards building a law enforcement system that protects women” (UNIFEM, 2007, p.4). For any attempt of GSPR to occur, measures should be applied on the society level as well as the police. “This can be a particular challenge in contexts where exerting violence against women is viewed as a male social prerogative” (UNIFEM, 2007, p. 5).

The common gender stereotypes affect the police since the police are part of the society. Some of the obstacles faced according to UNIFEM (p. 5) are:

- Under reporting by victim or witnesses;
- Impunity for perpetrators by social consensus;
- The pressure to treat violence against women as domestic disputes that can and should be settled outside the criminal justice system;
- The stigmatization of women who experience sexual violence from known persons;
- Blaming the victim;
- Treating abuse as a matter of shame for the victim;

In addition, a study conducted by Tara Denham entitled “Police Reform and Gender” (2008: p.16) states other types of obstacles:

- National police forces are not the only agents involved in policing. Fragile states often have multiple security agencies that have been developed and need to be addressed in security sector reform efforts.
• National police often work in conditions without equipment and are very poorly paid, while still being expected to carry out their changing mandates. This often results in rampant corruption as well as a reluctance to prioritize reform processes or gender issues.

• Police institutions are often very suspicious of civil society organizations and are reluctant to work with them, creating barriers for community organizations to provide input into reform process.

• Commitment to gender responsive police reform diminishes as crime begins to rise and police return to oppressive ways of addressing crime disadvantaging certain groups in society.

All these different barriers offer us a better understanding to the functioning of a post conflict society.

Post-conflict societies are mainly patriarchal societies where men forgive men for their violence against women. Cultural determined behaviors are an endeavor to remove or even alter through institutional reforms that do not engage with the entire society. Female and male police officers should be very well prepared in order to deal with crimes committed against women. Therefore a GSPR requires a specific training addressing gender-based violence. Police officers should be trained and prepared to deal with rape and abuse victims. The mentality is an essential matter where the police should be able to properly do their job instead of patronizing women and making them feel they deserve whatever situation they are in. Moreover, “while the criminalization of sexual and gender based violence are priorities for police reform in post conflict situations, they need to be accompanied by wider efforts to bring institutional mandates, doctrines, and strategic missions in line with gender equality principles” (UNIFEM, 2007, p. 5). For instance in Nicaragua, a gender perspective is defined as one of the nine institutional principles and values. Training is considered one of the most important steps of the reform. This phase should be marked by changes in operating protocols and procedures as well as a good incentive/sanction system. “Finally, performance measures should record staff commitment to gender equality principles, as reflected by the new types of policing that respond to women’s and men’s needs so that these innovations do not go unrecognized” (UNIFEM,2007, p. 6). In a GSPR, the creation of a police unit
dedicated to address crimes against women is an important step. These units have for purpose to create a safe environment for women as well as a safe refuge.

In her article “Police Reform and Gender” (2008, p. 21), Tara Denham gives recommendations for a simple model. There are three phases related to a reform. The first step to a successful initiative is planning. The planning step should include three main tasks:

1. Senior level commitment and support
2. Gender Assessment
3. Action Plans

It is essential to have senior level support in order for the reform to have a long lasting impact and the needed support in order to be properly function. This step should be accompanied with gender assessment followed by an action plan in order to define the proper framework and implementation process. The next step is the implementation process is divided into several tasks:

1. Gender responsive policies and procedures
2. Procedures and initiatives on gender based
3. Training
4. Recruitment, retention and promotion of women
5. Female police associations
6. Vetting processes
7. Multi-sectoral collaboration

The creation of new policies is essential during the reform process especially in topics related to sexual harassment. Training is fundamental at every step to be successful. According to the action plan gender sensitive training should be put in order to the recruits. Furthermore, the need of a multi-sectoral partnership is vital for a proper systematical work. After the implementation process is completed, a monitoring and evaluation system is required to assess the outcome and weaknesses of the reform. In order to have a more effective evaluating system, information campaigns and monitoring accountability as well as civilian oversight, are a great tool to monitor the outcomes.
In order to have a clearer view regarding gender sensitive policing, we can look into the case of Liberia. Liberia’s history is full of armed conflicts and military dictatorships. Reforming the security sector in Liberia includes rebuilding and retraining the national army and police as well as encouraging women to join the force. The Sirleaf administration for instance has set a goal of 20 percent women quota in the military and police. Liberia witnessed a gender sensitive reform. “In April 2005 the Liberian National Police (LNP) established the Women and Child Protection Unit (WACPU) with help from the United Nations mission in Liberia (UNIMIL) as well as UNICEF” (UNIFEM, 2007, p. 6). In 2007, Liberia witnessed an important step in its policing history: 105 female paramilitary officers from India came to Liberia to assist in the peace keeping process the country was witnessing after 14 of civil war. Liberia’s situation required a full SSR process after all the problems the country had suffered from. The UN missions as well as the United States are the main donors and primary supporters of the reform. “The American contribution to the SSR Program is provided through private contractors. While contractors may be good at providing basic and even advanced infantry training, they answer to private sector bosses whose bottom line is profit and are therefore not the ideal role models to install in the AFL the notion of duty to the country and military subordination to a democratically elected government. Indeed, in a country and region where recent history has been shaped by warlords and mercenaries, the U.S. Department of State has shown remarkable insensitivity by sending in contractors to shape the new army” (Malan, 2008, p.69). The reform initiative also suffered at the UN level due to the fact that SSR continues to slip into a systemic funding vacuum, while the Security Council continues to mandate missions to do SSR work, hoping that a “lead nation” will step up to the plate and provide both the leadership and resources to fulfill what it has prescribed as an essential task of UN peacekeeping. Even though the reform initiative in Liberia suffered from several flaws, it was considered successful on a gender sensitive scale. The reform had positive impact on the country especially on women participation in the security sector. “The Liberian National Police received three times the usual number of female applicants in the month following their deployment” (Denham, 2008, p. 17).

This chapter gives us an insight about the reforming the security sector in a post conflict society as well as we shed the light on gender sensitive reform. It also
allows us to set a benchmark to Lebanese case as well as to transition into the causes that led to this major step in Lebanon’s security sector. The next chapter is a detailed presentation about the ISF and the women’s situation in the force, allowing us a deep insight for analysis.
CHAPTER THREE

WOMEN IN THE INTERNAL SECURITY FORCES

The Internal Security Forces is struggling to become an independent and powerful security agency. This law enforcement agency has come a long way since its foundation in 1861. Obstacles such as religion and tribal mentality, and circumstances such as the French Mandate and civil wars all played a role in holding back the evolution of this agency. But still, with time the ISF has been struggling to embellish its image and strengthens its structure. This chapter will discuss the evolution of the ISF, how this history leads to the recruitment of women in a patriarchal environment, and finally highlights the transformation the ISF has undergone due to the general situation in the country. Understanding the structure of the ISF is imperative to identify the general image that has finally triggered the recruitment of women in the force and have a clearer understanding if these amendments are prospects to a reform.

3.1 History of the ISF:

The first police organization in Lebanon was formed in 1861 by a protocol that declared the creation of the Lebanese gendarmerie. Historically, and previously to that period, the Emir’s men were armed people responsible for the security as well as collecting taxes. During the Moutassarifiyat and under article 14 of the protocol, the Lebanese Gendarmerie was created constituting a ratio of seven officers to 1000 people. During the Ottoman regime and the First World War, the gendarmerie underwent several changes. The Ottoman lieutenants took over control of the security matters and disregarded the Lebanese gendarmerie responsibilities. They even changed the uniforms making them conform to Ottoman ones. During the French mandate the gendarmerie was a mess until they decided to reorganize the system. The reforms enacted at this time, including checkpoints and several other security measures, are still part of the modern police. “At independence, the Lebanese gendarmerie was widely known for its organization, effectiveness and
discipline, thanks to the efforts of the French delegation that carried out its mission during 23 years” (ISF, 2009, sec. 5.1). On the 12th of June 1959, by the decree NR 138, the establishment of the first directorate for the Internal Security Forces in Lebanon occurred. Currently, the new structure of the ISF is organized as follows:

![Organizational structure of the ISF](image)

Figure 3.1: Organizational structure of the ISF

The current ISF mission is “to meet the expectations of citizens and have their complete trust”. The ISF code of conduct states specifically its mission (Directorate General of the Internal Security Forces, (2011), Internal Security Forces Code of Conduct, “Booklet”: p. 7). The ISF is responsible to maintain security and order and combat crime through effective investigations, crime prevention and arrest perpetrators. Furthermore the ISF has to enforce the law fairly, protect people and property, protect rights and freedoms and make the best use of resources. The ISF embraces several values: The respect of human rights, honesty and integrity, equality and fairness, leadership by example as well as professionalism and courtesy (Code of Conduct, 2011).

In 2006, the ISF recruited 7500 new members of which 7350 were employed just after the 2006 war ended. After Lebanon suffered from the 2006 war, the ISF recruited 7350 new members (ISF headquarters, 2012). These numbers can give us an idea of the impact as well as the needs the war created. These new recruits were directly transferred to start their assignments without undergoing any kind of training. This exceptional situation led to this kind of decision making. Several police stations as well as other departments required the immediate employment of new members. Most of these members have later undergone training conducted by the American instructors in order to reform the police under the name of the Lebanon Police Program. This program had for purpose to train those recruits in all matters
related to police work and police safety, as well as equip the ISF with the required material and constructions.

Currently the ISF is going through several reform programs. The European Union is presently offering specialized training under the name of Security and Rule of Law “SAROL”. This program has the overall goal to reform the ISF. By ISF decree 1183 the SAROL program started on March 18, 2008. The training offered is for members of the ISF in order to improve their skills. It presents a theoretical training as well as practical ones mostly dedicated to the Mobile Forces. The classes are taking place in four different locations: Airport, Aramoun, Jamhour, and Werwar. The SAROL1 and SAROL 2 training spent from 2009 an approximate amount of €9,000 in assistance to the ISF. The first class trained 15 officers in order for the Lebanese lieutenants to take charge of this training later on. With time, the number increased adding 30 more officers in order to expand the training. This part of the program has for purpose to “train the trainer”. The SAROL does not have a considerable manpower available nor funds, thus it can only offers a limited kind of guidance. One thousand members of the ISF from different rankings have undergone the training so far. The SAROL training mainly highlights forensics and crimes scene management as well as empty hand techniques. The program also focuses on how to deal with any situation safely, while respecting all human rights standards “EU assistance to the ISF falls under the framework of the EU-Lebanon Action Plan jointly agreed by the Lebanese Government and the European Union and adopted in 2007. It fosters the professionalization efforts of the ISF as a legitimate police force, respected by all Lebanese citizens. In this respect, the EU support focuses on improving the ISF training capacity, mainly in the field of criminal investigation, through technical assistance, equipment and training, with the view of setting up the Judicial Police Practical Training Centre in Aramoun.” The program also focuses on how to deal with any situation safely, while respecting all human rights standards (European Union support to the Lebanese Police, sec. 1.4). The EU offers with the SAROL training, a support for the Mobile Forces (MF) in order to improve their capacity to manage public order using modern techniques in line with international democratic standards and the respect of human rights. “Since the beginning of the project in August 2009, the EU has delivered to the MF didactic equipment necessary for setting up a training room at its premises in Dbayeh, communication
equipment for a better management of complex scenarios, and provided technical training to future MF public order trainers; and to MF commanding officers for the management of public order in complex scenarios” (European Union support to the Lebanese Police, sec. 1.4). In addition, the SAROL offered training for the Judicial Police pursuing the train the trainer principle. The SAROL 2 is scheduled to end in 2014. The main purpose of the SAROL training whether with Mobile Forces, Judicial Police, specialized training in Aramoun… is the train the ISF Cadre in order for them to train the remaining ISF members. A main purpose is to retrain the top of the chain of commands will lead to the retraining of the whole ISF members. The SAROL believe that any attempt for a reel change should start from the top of the chain of command. The training also offers the opportunity of referring to experts to give certain classes. The SAROL is a training constantly expanding with a promising future of expansion of several branches in the ISF. For instance a training regarding inter force coordination is being planned. When a crime is committed or even an accident, the ISF and the Red Cross, the army and civil defense do not coordinate leading to a catastrophe in the field.

In 2008, a new important chapter was added to the ISF’s book. “The United Kingdom has since 2008 braced a program of capacity building for the ISF with the aim of strengthening the ISF’s relationship with the Lebanese public. The premise is that with a consistent output of transparent and responsive policing, the police forces would gain trust and consent of the good public, resulting in a more trusting society” (Ziyad Baroud, personal communication, November. 13, 2012). During Minister Baroud’s service in the government, the collaboration between the ministry of Interior and Municipalities, the United Kingdom and the UN human rights office gave the fruit of the ISFs’ code of conduct. “The vision of this Code of Conduct is to meet the expectations of citizens and have their complete trust” (Ziyad Baroud, personal communication, November. 13, 2012). The United Kingdom embassy hired a nonprofit organization entitled Northern Ireland Co-operation Overseas “NI-CO” to implement an assistance program for the ISF. This measure is considered highly important for it is the only one that conducted a strategy review of the ISF. The project is entitled “ISF PRO” where the mission is based on strategic planning, Human rights and public outreach. The purpose of this assistance program is to push the ISF to take charge through a defined strategic plan. The ISF should be the one the
one coordinating the donation and foreign training assistance. This project led to the creation of a strategic planning and donor coordination center. In addition to creating the code of conduct, the UK program was the first to conduct an exhaustive survey in 2009 regarding the public’s trust towards the ISF. The results show that only 13 percent fully trust the ISF in conducting their job. Furthermore a project entitled the senior leader course is being conducted. This project started in 2012 and is scheduled for 3 years in order to train all the officers and equip them with the skills to lead and manage change. The newest project is entitled the policing pilot project that is scheduled to take place in Hbeish station. This project will be led by the ISF in order to truly benefit from the project. This step will be accompanied with a pilot Information and Analysis unit. This project is a pilot project that will test for the first time the most adequate way of policing convenient to the Lebanese society. A follow up survey is planned for the year 2013 to evaluate the current level of trust towards the ISF.

The biggest reform program is run by the International Narcotics and Law Enforcement Affairs sponsored by the US department of State. This reform consists of rehabilitating the ISF cadets by the American police in cooperation with Lebanese lieutenants. This agreement was signed by the Lebanese government and the United States government. The mission started in 2008 and has donated 100 million dollars in form of vehicles, funds, construction, equipment and training. This program was extended to introduce a modern way of policing called community policing in 2009. The small training program was considered very successful that led to the extension of the program. The first class of lieutenants trained constituted of 21 members which 20 of them travelled to Kentucky in the United States to undergo training. This first class was intended for the lieutenants that will be training in the Community policing program later on. After this training was conducted, the community policing program was launched. 3074 cadets went through the Lebanon Police Program while 2000 other members underwent the community policing training. Furthermore, other kinds of training enforcing this reform exist such as the In-Service training that is taking place all over Lebanon.

The aim of this reform is not solely to train police in tactical matters. It is also a window to modernize police mentality in Lebanon. The new policing system is based on equality, serving the public and even overcoming gender issues at work.
Gender topics are very delicate for the ISF thus leading the training to include classes entitled “Gender Issues” and “Diversity Awareness”. For the last year, the nature of the training changed in order to accommodate the new ISF requirements. The ISF recruited several new cadets and sergeants. The Lebanon Police Program in partnership with the Lebanese lieutenants conducted the training for the new members. This training also involved the first female training ISF witnessed. The program also offered for some of the sergeants and generals and several ranks in between to go to the United States and undergo specialized training there. The total of the US mission different training programs resulted in 10 255 police men and women from dissimilar rankings where 8 441 graduated successfully from the classes.

The ISF receives several donations worldwide participating in its evolution. The donations consist of equipment as well as constructions of facilities and money. Several countries that are helping Lebanon are also offering training for the officers abroad. For instance, France offers the officers training for one year in “Ecole Nationale Superieure des Officiers de la Police” after undergoing a series of exams and interviews to select the appropriate candidates. Other training in different countries differs in longevity as well as in the nature of the program itself. “Today, the ISF are acting in cooperation not only with western countries (The United States, France, Germany, England, Austria, and Australia) but also with Arab countries (The United Arab Emirates, Qatar, The Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, Jordan and Egypt)” (Belloncle, 2006, p. 8). Several officers from different branches have been sent to one of those countries in order to go through different trainings improving their skills. The same officer can be sent to several different countries to undergo more detailed training regarding their work. For instance an officer working at the airport would go abroad for training regarding airport security. For example these are different training abroad regarding the airport: basic training for airport security personnel, crisis management, aviation security supervisor, aviation and cargo security, national auditors and inspectors or aviation security management.

Every donation made to the Lebanese government has to be published in the official journal. For instance by decree 7569 issued December 28, 2011, the ISF accepted a donation from the European Union through Intertech Batinorm company for the amount of 1,154,764,000 L.L.. This donation was intended for the Mobile
forces. A more recent example would be from the German embassy that donated 181,000,000 L.L. for the computing department in form of servers. The constant donation for the ISF is an ongoing project.

The ISF’s general directorate is always working on improving the image of policing in the country as well as incorporating programs and measures to cope with change. The decision to include women is one of many initiatives validating the reality of this commitment. The security system in Lebanon suffers greatly after all the wars the country underwent and the years of occupation. As we can see, the security system, despite struggling with so many obstacles, is striving for a better structure that reflects a modern Lebanon.

### 3.2 The ISF’s transformation:

The security sector in Lebanon has suffered greatly due to all the circumstances the country witnessed. Even though the ISF is one of the oldest Lebanese institutions, it has never been fully able to fulfill its complete duties. The first real attempt reforming the ISF occurred in the 1990’s after the signing of the Ta’ef agreement. This agreement was very important regarding police matters because Lebanon signed the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. This affects directly the ISF’s work. Furthermore, the agreement states “When the danger is such that it exceeds the capacity of the Internal Security Forces to confront it alone, the army is to protect public order and support the ISF in the preservation of security and only when the ISF is able to accomplish its security mission could it return to its barracks”. The ISF does not have the power to execute all its duties in the streets therefore the army interferes to assist them. The reality is that the ISF usually played the role as an auxiliary to the army. This delicate situation is due to the history of Lebanon. Several detailed studies offered many analyses for the ISF’s weaknesses. When the Syrian army came to Lebanon in 1976 in order to assist the country in restoring order, it failed its duties and remained in the nation. Dr. Omar Nashabe explains that during the phase where the Syrian troops (army and intelligence) were in Lebanon they were providing internal security stability and were forcefully involved in the most intimate governmental matters. In other words, they were occupied with most of the duties with which the ISF should have been occupied.
“The intricate political internal and regional tensions that prevailed were obstructive to adequate reform within the Internal Security Forces and the General Security organization” (Nashabe, Lecture conducted at the Lebanese American University, 2009, p. 1).

On the other hand, Dr. Edouard Belloncle, in his study entitled “prospects of Security Sector Reform in Lebanon”, elaborated more reasons regarding the fragility of the ISF. Belloncle believes that traditionally the army had the role of policing and maintaining internal order. He adds that the nature of the crimes that police should deal with were almost inexistent during the Syrian terror era. A strong policing system requires the collaboration of several institutions like immigration and the Department of Justice and many others. These conditions were unacceptable during Syrian tutelage because it made it harder to control the situation. The impact of the Syrian era was very broad on the Lebanese army. During this period, Lebanese officers were sent to Syrian military schools. Syria also donated Soviet Tanks like the T54 and the T122. Syria preached about the weaknesses of the Lebanese army in order to demoralize its morale and make it easier for Syria to dominate the institution. This doctrine was clear in 2000 after the withdrawal of Israel from the South when Syria declined to deploy the Lebanese army to areas finally relinquished by the Israelis. Picard explained “what happened in Lebanon is that the local government took charge of managing only day-to-day affairs, focusing particularly on the economic question, whereas foreign policy and security matters - the real token of state sovereignty were turned over to Syria” (Belloncle, 2006, p. 14). The ISF authority was practically inexistent due to the ongoing wars followed by the Syrian domination leading to the current political situation crippling any reel attempts for change.

On the 6th of September 1990, the ISF published “Law 17” entitled “the Organization of the Internal Security Forces” signed by the President of the Lebanese Republic and voted by the Parliament. This law redefines the restructured ISF, detailing its organization. In other words Law 17 recreated the ISF after the war. This law was followed on the second of May 1991 by the publication of the decree 1157. The decree 1157 is entitled “The Structural Organization of the Internal Security Forces”. 1157 was published by the Lebanese President of the Republic based on the constitution and the Law 17 specifically article 7 with the suggestion of the Minister
of Interior as well as the consent of the Council of State and the ISF High Council. This decree is entitled “Organic structure of the Internal Security Forces” that offers a detailed structural organization of the ISF. It defines the titles of each branch as well as their detailed scope of work.

The distinction between the role of the army and the ISF seems to be unclear in Lebanon. After the Ta’ef agreement, one of the main focuses was strengthening the army and increasing the number of its troops. For instance, in 1996, the law named “Loi du drapeau” granted the army the opportunity to reach the number of 50000 troops and 3200 officers within a ten years duration. This decision fortified the state authority and allowed the sectarian balance in an institution where Christians were a minority. The focus on the army was on the detriment of the ISF. The Ta’ef agreement stated in the decree number 1460 of July 1991 that the ISF workforce should have a total of 29 000 members. Unfortunately, this decision wasn’t fulfilled. The current ISFs number reached after 11 years, 26 000 which is still less the ideal number or “malak” number in ISF terms. Minister Baroud indicates that recent studies shows that current needs requires 32 000 ISF members to be able to fulfill all its duties over the whole Lebanese territory. On the financial level, the ISF is granted 3.3 percent of the national budget in contrast to the military that receives 21.5 percent. The need of help from the army during demonstrations, bombings and riots undermines the ISF’s abilities to take charge. Belloncle argues that the army is not ready to abandon its internal mission to the ISF because it allows it more influence in the political sphere.

The officers’ academy in Lebanon is the same for the army, the ISF, the GS, Customs and Security of States. In the training procedure, all the members of the security sector are being educated the same way and with the same mentality. The training conducted is dominated by the military mentality. The graduating officers are the one in charge later on of training the recruits. In other terms, the military mentality is being transmitted to the police. The ISF’s uniform is even the same as the army that only differs in the color. The firm distinction between the notion of the ISF being the sole unit in charge of internal conflicts and matters and the army being only responsible of the country’s borders, is not available. The concept of policing does not consist of military action only, it is based on people skills and community oriented policing which differs completely from army standards. Thus it is
imperative to have a difference in the training phase due to the different tasks and the terms of treatment. Another weakness rose during the wave of bombings that started in 2004. The lack of scientific equipment and anti-terrorism program and specialized crime investigation skills became very obvious and necessary.

The assassination of Prime Minister Rafik El Hariri and all the martyrs who followed the retreat of the Syrian troops in 2005 was a turning point for the ISF. The general political mentality in Lebanon changed and an Anti-Syrian government was created. A major shift in local and international politics led to the main focus to be on reinforcing the Lebanese Army and the ISF. The new mentality shifted in order to empower the ISF and Army and develop them in order to accomplish their duties. After the aftermath of 2005, the ISF’s information unit’s work became more accentuated. The ISF’s information unit started to became more powerful and present. The work became focused on anti-terrorism missions as well as any major crime affecting the country. Some would interpret the situation as a counterweight to Lebanese military intelligence which is seen to have close relations with Damascus. The newly-formed security apparatus was largely trained and supplied by US and pro-US Arab intelligence services, including Saudi Arabia.

The 2006 war affected the security system in Lebanon highlighting the need to strengthen the army and the police’s presence in the country. After the war ended, a new situation arose in the country. The Nahr el Bared conflicts started in May 2007 and ended in September 2007. The situation with Fateh el Islam dragged the ISF and the Lebanese army into a war with the Palestinian camp that lead to several losses in the ranks. Following those tragic events in Lebanon, the international help started to flow in Lebanon in order to help the security sector. It was in 2008 that the missions started marking a new phase for the security sector. In the following years the number of training programs increased as well as the number of countries helping Lebanon. The government also showed their commitment to this new phase by committing to the new training programs as well as promoting a new mentality regarding policing. The Ministry of Interior and Municipalities supervised by Minister Baroud supported and encouraged the following topics:

- A strategic plan for the ISF that could tackle the organizational challenges.
- The elaboration of the Code of Conduct
Community policing program leading to more openness to the public
Recruitment of Women
Enhancing the Inspection
Establishment of a hotline for complaints

Furthermore a “Human Rights Department was established at the ISF Inspectorate General by virtue decree 755, dated 3 January 2008 with a mandate to disseminate knowledge of Human Rights, protect human rights against violations and enhance human rights awareness amongst ISF members in the exercise of their powers. The ISF is constantly working on improving their image” (Code of Conduct, 2011, p. 16). The new concept of community oriented policing and ameliorating the relationship with the public became a major goal. Even on the media level, the ISF allowed the local MTV channel to shoot the police while committing raids and missions. The show entitled “Bel Jerem el Machhoud” is the Lebanese version of COPS that is allowing the public to see the professional side of the ISF. Currently the last step marking the ISF’s path would be the recruitment of women in the force. This step that occurred in 2012 is the most modern and drastic change ISF has witnessed. Part of the reform is allowing Lebanese women to prove themselves and contribute, although through shy steps, in protecting their country.

3.3 The current situation of women in the ISF:

As already discussed, the female presence in the ISF was almost inexistent in the past years. Lebanon has witnessed a delay regarding the recruitment of women in ISF even in comparison to the countries in the region (General Commander Ashraf Rifi, personal communication, March 17, 2011). The Lebanese Army (LA) as well as the General Security (GS) witnessed women’s presence long before the ISF. Women in the army are limited to desk jobs and are not viewed as military soldier material. The GS recruited women in 1984; several female members reached the ranks of General. In other words the GS holds the highest rank for women in the Middle East. As for General Security, in 2009, a new initiative took place where women were stationed at the airport. This step was very successful and proved the prejudice wrong. Women’s performance and efficiency were proven higher and society did not deal with this change in a negative way. This step was very important but it still was another stepping stone for women only in desk jobs.
Major Suzanne Hajj and Captain Dyala Mehtar were the only two female members in the ISF until 2012. In 2001, the public relations division in the general directorate of the ISF requested the need for specialized officers. It was for the first time in their official requests that the ISF directorate omitted to mention that the position was only for men. This lucky mistake led for several women to apply thus making Hajj and Mehtar the first female officers and ISF’s only women. Major El Hajj majored in computing and communication engineering as for captain Mehtar, she majored in computing. In contradiction with the army and the GS, the nature of the two female officer’s job was not only related to desk job work.

Captain Mehtar worked in several different departments leading currently to the computing department in the ISF. Major Hajj participated in several undercover missions and worked in several departments: the Information Unit, Communication Department, the Mobile Forces, the Judicial Police, headed the Technical Department in the counterterrorism unit, and is currently in charge of the Cyber Crime Unit and Intellectual Property Bureau. Moreover Major Hajj and Captain Mehtar were both members of the committees recruiting women and men in the force. Furthermore, Major El Hajj was in charge of giving all the previous classes lectures regarding gender issues and her personal experience. Even though the ISF is a male dominant environment, Hajj managed to prove herself and was elected by the International Association of Women Police in 2010 as Women police of the year. She was considered one of the most effective people working on recruiting women in the ISF. She believes women have attributes that are essential to policing that will improve the quality of work and remediate the flaws in the system. “Women’s humanity and compassion contribute to the application of Human Rights. Women by nature love organization and arrangement which allows them to do several jobs with distinction. Also, women have a prompt co-operation with the community, which leads to the success of the performance of community policing and preventive security” (Women Police, 2010).
In 2012, the ISF had a plan to recruit 4000 sergeants and cadets. These new recruits will be \( \frac{1}{4} \) Muslim and \( \frac{3}{4} \) Christian in order to rebalance the quota. In everything related to government employment, a quota of 50 percent Christian and 50 percent Muslim must be respected. An ISF member is the enforcer of the law without discrimination in other terms a servant to the law thus not involved in politics, religion, groups, etc. The ISF member took an oath to protect every needing member of the Lebanese society thus should becoming a reference for any person in the country. The General Directorate issued a decision regarding veiled women in the force. Women wearing the veil will not wear the ISF’s uniform thus performing their work in plain clothes in specific departments. Any religious indicators are not acceptable on duty while wearing the uniform. The ISF is very unique regarding this decision in contrast to the other security institutions in Lebanon. It is the only security agency allowing veiled women on the force and even witnessed issues regarding this topic.

In 2012, the ISF have trained the first 2000 members and with the beginning of 2013 the next 2000 will start their training. This new decision included the first women classes. The new female recruits were divided between sergeants and cadets.
depending on their education level. The females who have obtained a high school
degree or higher would start their careers as sergeants as for the regular cadets they
should have a minimum of grade 7. The female members were hired based on the
50/50 religious quota. Since the beginning of March, 480 female sergeants and 70
cadets (members without ranking) have been recruited. These new members were
divided as such: Werwar academy hosted 90 sergeants and 70 cadets, Aramoun
hosted 195 female sergeants and Dbayeh hosted 197 female sergeants. The
applicants’ detailed situation is explained in these tables obtained from the
computing department of the ISF:

Table 3.1: Applicant Age

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[19-20]</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[20-21]</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[21-22]</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[22-23]</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[23-24]</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[24-25]</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[25-26]</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[26-27]</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[27-28]</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[28-29]</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.2: Applicants Casa of Origin

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Casa/ Mouhafaza</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Beirut</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mount Lebanon</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bekaa</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nabatiyeh</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The female applicants hold a higher education level than the usual male applicants. The ISF statistics for their staff also shows that the education level is higher for the women than the men. 67 of the female trainees are university graduates. They hold a variety of bachelor degree and master’s degree. In other words 10.9 percent of the women are college graduates, 26.7 percent have not graduated from school and 62.2 percent have graduated or in other words completed the baccalaureate and enrolled in universities. These statistics are considered to be a very positive step in comparison to men that hold lower educational levels. It is essential to mention that several girls hold higher degrees than mentioned in the statistics.

The new female members went through a specific process. I will explain the situation chronologically starting from the recruitment process up to the process of assigning women to their stations:

a) Recruitment Process:

11000 females applied for the 1100 number of positions. When the general directorate decided to recruit women they did not specify the number needed. At a later time the Council of Command decided that the recruitment will consist of 1100 female members that will be divided between 2 classes. The triage system is a long process that occurred a year and half before the training actually started. The first stage consists of undergoing a medical exam. After being cleared, the cadet will stand in front of a jury. The jury will ask several questions and requests. If the cadet succeeds in his tasks, he proceeds to the second step and undertakes the physical exam. The physical exam is constituted of pushups, sit ups and a 1.5Km run. The last step is the written examination. At this stage, the women and men will undertake this task together. This step is the most decisive because it accounts for 75% of the total grade. The rest is based on the physical test.

b) Training:

After the recruiting process ended, the first class started in March 2012. As previously noted, the training facilities were Dbayeh, Werwar and Aramoun. The female classes are the same as the men’s on the theoretical and physical level. The classes were separate but the training took place in mixed academies. The first female cadets’ class graduated on the 19 of July 2012. The training was conducted
by the American mission as well as the Lebanese officers. The lack of female officers led to hiring female civilian in charge of the women in the sleeping areas and responsible for searching them every time they come back from a weekend. Major El Hajj was in charge of the academy in Dbayeh. The training aimed at first for getting the women in a good physical shape doing all kinds of physical training, obstacle courses and marching. The cadets took classes related to law, skills, investigations, human rights, firearms and democratic policing. The classes cover several topics starting from the simplest task of talking to people to doing building searches. The program constantly emphasizes the importance of police safety and even introduces them to specialized training. Many classes were taught regarding cybercrime, suicide bombers, forensics, and high risk traffic stops, among other topics. The classes were divided between the American instructors and the Lebanese lieutenants. The women had to take an exam every week as well as go through graded structured scenarios. The structured scenarios consist of actors playing a real life crisis which the ISF members had to face in teams. These practical exams (called ‘practicals’ in everyday speech) enforced the team building skills, communication skills, and preparation for real life as an ISF officer. It also allowed them to create muscle memory which is most essential in police work. Studies have shown that when the body is under great deal of stress, it will react the way it is trained. Several practicals were conducted in the streets, such as traffic stops.

Furthermore, the women had to go to shooting ranges to practice their firearms skills. Weapons lessons were given regarding several different kinds of weapon that are: M16, AK47, HK, Smith and Wesson 9mm Hand gun. Firearms training for men and women also occurred by using a teaching program called MILO. MILO is an interactive system that allows the police to practice all kinds of firearms using real weapons where bullets are substituted with laser. It also allows scenario interaction where police train to evaluate the timing to use deadly force. The lessons related to handguns and rifles were put to use in the firing range and MILO rooms where the female abilities exceeded the men’s. Results showed that women are more accurate shooters than men. Another crucial part of the training is regarding the recruits moral. The supervisors in charge emphasized all through the training the equality between men and women in the force as well as the importance of professionalism in their work. The ideas repeated by all the training team created a
sense of power and loyalty to the ISF; it made the recruits excited to work and willing to contribute to positive change in the ISF.

The first sergeants class graduated on the 19th of September 2012. The sergeants go through the same training physically and on the curriculum level but they take extra lessons related to leadership and team leader skills. These skills are essential since the sergeants will be in position of responsibility thus necessitating a longer and more specific training. The extra training is entitled “the supervisor course”. The media played a fundamental part by transmitting female training in the news. The videos showed powerful women committing to hard physical training. It was the first time women in the force were exposed to the public in this image. This situation was unique for the ISF differentiating them from Army and the GS.

The general directorate decided during the security month to have members from all the academies rotating in patrols daily all over Lebanon. This initiative included the women too. It was the first time that the public would encounter to female ISF members in the street. The general reaction was positive leading to several discussions in the media.

The next class for female ISF officers will start in February 2013. It will include the second half of the recruited members. The second class will be easier to organize on the logistics level. The graduated sergeants will be part of the next training class removing the need to hire civilians for proctoring and searching purposes. Furthermore, all the accommodations related to water closets, curtains for the sleeping area as well as health requirements are already taken in consideration and will be improved due to previous mistakes. For instance, during the first academy the female required different health accommodation than men. The need of a doctor at the academy regularly checking on the female members became a must. Simple logistics matters will be ameliorated due to previous experiences.

Since altered in order to recruit women, recruitment and training has improved lately showing the will of the ISF to encourage constructive change. This transformation is not limited to one specific area as we will see later. The plan of this reform is to have women actively in the force contributing in improving police work and not restricted to desk job (General Commander Ashraf Rifi, personal communication, March. 17, 2011).
In conclusion the Lebanese law enforcement agency has adopted change as part of its progress. This engagement to the new path is driven by several factors. The next chapter is interpretation analyzing the reasons behind the change.
CHAPTER FOUR

CAUSES FOR THE CRITICAL TIMING OF THE REFORM

Women’s recruitment is considered to be one of the most important steps in recent ISF history. The timing of this decision is an intricate matter to explain. Several factors could be the causes of this unique resolution. Foreign assistance programs, the flaws in the system, the previous successful experiences or even political reasons are different interpretations for women’s recruitment. In this chapter, we will be discussing the impact of each step in order to conclude later on the answer to why the decision to recruit women into the ISF was taken now.

4.1 The foreign assistance programs:

As previously mentioned, Lebanon is currently receiving assistance from several foreign countries. The United States of America, France, Germany, England, Austria, Australia, The United Arab Emirates, Qatar, the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, Jordan and Egypt are the countries the ISF is working in collaboration with. The ISF officers are travelling to the countries aforementioned in order to go through specific training in several different fields.

As previously noted, the United States of America and the European Union are offering training in Lebanon for several ISF members from different rankings. The SAROL training has a limited amount of funds and the number of members trained is considered limited in contrast to the American mission. In terms of funds, equipment, construction and training, the American mission is the most influential in Lebanon. In this chapter, we will discuss in details the Lebanon Police program in order to evaluate its impact on police reform initiative. In Table 5.1 below are available the detailed numbers of cadets and officers that underwent through the training. The information summarize the last five years the mission has been training in Lebanon according to the Lebanese Police Program. As for Table 5.2, it represents a detailed presentation of the donations made by the Department of States except for the price of the Ford Explorers cars and the portable radios’ costs. According to the Department of States, the amount of those two equipment amount to 30 million
dollars. In total, the gross of all the assistance presented to the ISF is 100 million dollars since 2008, donated in different types of offering. The same data was not available for the two other missions.

Table 4.1: Total of classes taught by the American Mission

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of the course</th>
<th>Number of courses</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Number enrolled</th>
<th>status</th>
<th>Number of graduates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Basic Academies (Male)</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>Enrolled</td>
<td>3986</td>
<td>Graduated</td>
<td>3074</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Academies (Female)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Enrolled</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>Graduated</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCO Basics Academy (Male)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Enrolled</td>
<td>1059</td>
<td>Graduated</td>
<td>775</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCO Basics Academy (Female)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Enrolled</td>
<td>289</td>
<td>Graduated</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisor and Management</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Enrolled</td>
<td>279</td>
<td>Graduated</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Policing</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Enrolled</td>
<td>1746</td>
<td>Graduated</td>
<td>1310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Policing for Officers</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Enrolled</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Graduated</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Instructor Courses</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>Enrolled</td>
<td>513</td>
<td>Graduated</td>
<td>411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Day High Risk Traffic Stops</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>Enrolled</td>
<td>548</td>
<td>Graduated</td>
<td>548</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Day MILO/Handcuffing/O.C./Vest</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Enrolled</td>
<td>437</td>
<td>Graduated</td>
<td>437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Day mounted Horse Patrol</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Enrolled</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>Graduated</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Day MILO Black Panthers</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Enrolled</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>Graduated</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less Lethal Shotgun</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Enrolled</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>Graduated</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Service 2 day training</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Enrolled</td>
<td>1240</td>
<td>Graduated</td>
<td>1207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>Enrolled</td>
<td>10255</td>
<td>Graduated</td>
<td>8441</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Information taken from Lebanon Police Program
Table 4.2: Total of Donations made by the American Mission

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Equipment</th>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Cost $</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>APC ( UPS)</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>83,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ford Vehicles</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>Unspecified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dodge Charger Vehicle model 1</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>7,749 000 (25 830 per car)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dodge Charger Vehicle model 2</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>3,042 067.2 (25 350.56 per car)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harley Davidson MC’s 2010</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1,276 224 (63 811.20 per motorcycle)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spare parts for 24 motorcycles</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>90,062.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vertex Standard Encrypted Portable Radios</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>Unspecified</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Donations for the Mobile Forces</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Water Truck 4000 Gallon</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>494,120 (123,530 per water truck)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bus 56 Passenger</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>683,100 (113,850 per Bus)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Donations for Prison</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Prison Van</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>212,936.25 (70,978.75 per Van)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fitness equipment</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Smith Machine 7 degree counterbalanced</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCIFIT Climber 14</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dumbbell Rack</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>15,069</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item</td>
<td>Quantity</td>
<td>Unit Price</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Olympic weight Plate Tree</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Olympic Weight Set</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Firing Range</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Firing Range Aramoun</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steel Container 3m*13m</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refrigerator</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freezer</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Door locking Cabinet</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transistorized Megaphones</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety hearing protection</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traffic cones</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wooden Target Backers</td>
<td>291</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steel target frame</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Firing Range Dbayeh</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dbayeh firing range material</td>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Narcotics</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Narcotics Dodge Durango 2012</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>36,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Narcotics Dodge Nitro 2011</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>24,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Narcotics Nissan Urvan 2012</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>23,900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Narcotics Laptop Computer model 1</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>629</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Narcotics Laptop Computer model 2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1,010.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Narcotics Laptop</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>919.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item</td>
<td>Quantity</td>
<td>Unit Cost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer model 3 laptop</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Printer</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>674.65 (134.93 per unit)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digital Voice Recorder</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digital Camera</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6,549</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digital Camcorder</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UPS</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memory Card</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Narcotics conference room fully equipped</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>31,669</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water tank 4000 Liters (transported to Mazraa)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>23,540</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**ISF Academy- Kitchen Refurbishment**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Quantity</th>
<th>Unit Cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Heavy duty gas hot pot</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20,0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heavy duty gas hot pot with storage base</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>27,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imperial heavy duty gas range</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>36,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working table with backsplash</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service working table with upstand</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dishwashing table</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wall mounted hand wash basin</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deep gas fryer</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single wall shelf with brackets</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pot wash sink unit</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1,780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service trolley</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solid 2 door refrigerator</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Island type induction hood with fresh air</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14,640</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item</td>
<td>Quantity</td>
<td>Value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wire shelf</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1,250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turbo air</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rack trolley</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1,050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tables</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1,800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walk in freezer</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>34,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wire shelf</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Air conditions</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>39,714</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Printer</td>
<td>29</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UPS</td>
<td>34</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Desktop Computer</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>42,592</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LCD projector</td>
<td>33</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LCD projector screen</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>4,158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Desk and Chair</td>
<td>1500</td>
<td>95,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White board</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>1,540.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cork Board</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1,069.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MILO range Pro</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>67,534.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MILO equipment</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>93,257.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISF Academy-Training Gear Equipment</td>
<td>56,962</td>
<td>2,987,755.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISF Zahle and Saida</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3,335.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISF academy paintball guns and pistols</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>7,376.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nahr El Bared Police Station</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Naher el Bared police station and equipment</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1,132,248.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Relations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Relations equipment</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>13,702.02</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Information from the U.S. Department of State

The American mission accepted to grant me the detailed values of donations as previously mentioned. The SAROL training as well as the United Kingdom project
were very cooperative in giving me the information needed but the tables were unavailable to the public.

The foreign assistance programs seek to promote professionalism and are one of the main drivers of a change in mentality in the Lebanese police. Whether it is by launching the code of conduct, encouraging human rights and equality, or endorsing the basics of proper communication with the public, the foreign assistance programs are indeed changing the mentality. The Code of Conduct set for the ISF was complimented by classes taught which were entitled: Human Rights, Gender Issues, Diversity awareness, Torture Prohibition and Human Rights and Police Service. Women’s recruitment in the ISF has long been mentioned in the curriculum taught by the Lebanon Police Program as well as pursued by the UK program since 2008. During the classes, the problems faced due to the absence of women in the Lebanese ISF were highlighted. During every class trained by the American mission, Major Suzan el Hajj gave a conference about the importance of women in the force and explained about her successful experience. Several classes were taught regarding gender issues, equality in the services as well as diversity awareness. The UK assistance is training the officers from the rank of lieutenant to general in order to change the mentality and become accomplished policemen. These preemptive measures were necessary in order to prepare ISF’s member for women’s inclusion in the service. The American mission was one of the main entities pushing and working on the mentality change in the ISF. The UK also pushed for women recruitment since 2008 and made it clear in the Strategic Planning Workshop. During this workshop the ISF committed to women recruitment in the presence of the General Commander Riffi and the senior command. In addition to that the code of conduct is an essential tool guarantying equality. The creation of the code of conduct in collaboration with the United Kingdom was another step towards promoting equality and setting the rules protecting women and men in the ISF.

The fieldwork conducted leads to the conclusion that the foreign assistance programs worked primarily on the mentality change which can be considered as the hardest task. These initiatives contributed in paving the way for women’s recruitment. In addition to that the American mission not only contributed in previous measures but also in the training phase. The women recruitment could have
been caused by several factors. The flaws in the system are another main cause that required women’s presence in the ISF.

4.2 The flaws in the system:

The absence of female presence in the ISF has long caused difficulties for police work. Previous failed experiences in the ISF highlight the importance of having female police nowadays. Several personal interviews conducted with ISF lieutenants (who wish to remain anonymous) draw attention to the impact of the absence of women in the ISF. The several examples given in this chapter are merely a small sample of a large sum of violations showing that the system was harming the ISF and limiting their abilities to properly conduct their work. Several problems were detected: Searching, Rape and Domestic Violence, Traffic Stops, Criminal Acts and Exceptional Cases.

For example, the law states that a man does not have the right or the authority to search a woman. Searching is one of the hardest problem the ISF faced previously in airports, stations prisons and dangerous arrests. The airport witnessed a lot of exceptional cases. Formerly the ISF hired contractual female workers in order to do the search at the airport. They were given a different dress code from the ISF and were not considered ISF members. Even with the presence of contractual civilians to conduct the searches, several problems still emerged. To state an example, a Filipino woman refused to get on a plane, took her clothes off and started running in the airport. The ISF couldn’t act immediately and had to refer to the help of females from the GS and the contractors” (ISF lieutenant, 2012). This situation did not cause any threat to people’s safety but it could have in other cases.

Furthermore, on the stations level, when a girl was arrested and needed to be searched, it was considered a hard matter. Female police were inexistent and the ISF requested the presence of female contractor this situation would put the policemen life in danger as well as delay the process of their work. The use of female contractor in the station was very scarce; and most police stations would refer for help from the female cleaning crew or people of trust like the “Moukhtar’s” (Mayor) wife and ISF female family members.
The situation in the prisons is different. The female inmates were only searched by men using a metal detector, as for the parents coming to visit; the ISF would occasionally require the presence of contractual females to conduct the search. Female absence in the force made police work a hard matter to achieve.

Rape and domestic violence reporting rates are very low. Some ISF would relate this negative outcome to the female absence. “It is harder for a woman to confide in a male police officer after having been raped. A woman cannot tolerate to see a man after experiencing such a traumatizing experience. A female victim would feel safer around a policewoman after having been raped or the object of domestic violence” (International Trainer at the Lebanese police academy, 2012). Minister Baroud particularly accentuates the importance of women regarding the topic of rape and domestic violence. These delicate matters are far better being dealt by a woman than a man.

As for traffic stops, the ISF faced another setback when conducting traffic stops. In these cases, if a suspected car was pulled over, the female in the car as dangerous as she could have been, could not be searched. Police officers who manage traffic face a lot of trouble with civilian women. “For instance a female ran over a red light in Achrafieh, a police motorcyclist stopped her and asked her for her papers. She stepped out of the car and started beating him while screaming that she was being harassed” (ISF lieutenant, 2011). In the same situation, another woman took the tickets note book and ripped it as well as she tore her own ticket. In this case, the policeman does not have the authority to arrest her without the district attorneys’ permission. It is clear, when a policeman is being insulted by a woman, the law limits their actions. Another example is when a female civilian insulted the ISF’s team during a traffic stop. The only solution the team referred to was taking the plate number then sending her an official request to come down to the station (ISF lieutenant, 2011). The long procedures and the law would prevent a policeman to take any immediate actions even if he was being insulted.

Furthermore, the obstacles created by women’s absence in the force led criminals to benefit from it. Women became more and more present in illicit groups since it is easier for them to violate the law. Women are used as a guarantee for the success of illegal actions. “During the phase where roads were being blocked by
burning tires or individual themselves, women were used as frontline members in order for the ISF to be handicapped. The incapacity to arrest the troublemakers is giving them the advantage of turning women into a shield for unlawful activities” (ISF lieutenant, 2012). A very good example regarding women as criminals would be a traffic stop conducted for safety reasons. The story is being told by Major Suzanne Hajj: “A bus was pulled over and policemen searched the bus asking people for their identification papers. A woman on the bus was behaving abnormally and refused to give her papers. Knowing that the policemen did not have the right to search her, she became more and more uncooperative. She was suspected of being under the influence of drugs and after the ISF member contacted me, the women was arrested and brought to the station. This situation occurred before women’s recruitment happened which led to ask the sister of an ISF member to conduct the search. The results showed that she had several checks without balance due to illicit jobs” (Major Suzanne Hajj, personal communication, November 24, 2012).

Diverse cases are also being faced; during elections, a woman wearing the chador could not be identified. This situation presents an obstacle to police work where the identity of the woman wearing the chador is impossible to validate as much as identify if this person might present a security threat in this situation. Women wearing the chador can easily conceal any weapon without the power of the ISF to search them in these situations. On the other hand, Roumieh prison witnessed their fair share of obstacles. Situations are being manipulated by civilians in order to feed their personal interest. “The prisoners’ parents were having a protest in front of Roumieh prison. One of the prisoners’ mother attacked the ISF policemen and started yelling in front of the camera that she was being harassed” (ISF lieutenant, 2011).

Women are being used as dangerous tools to avoid justice. All those previous examples are only a sample for what the ISF has suffered from. The need for the presence of female police officers is clearly essential in order for the ISF to reach its full potential.

4.3 Successful previous experiences:

The ISF is considered to be the last security institution to recruit women in the force. The Army and GS were the first taking the step of women’s recruitment. The GS was the first institution to witness the recruitment of women in 1976. The
first step occurred 13 years before the Army considered recruiting women to the force. This unique experience was considered an empowering step for women, who represent half of the society. In 2009, another major step occurred where women were introduced to regular staff at the airport for the first time. It was an exceptional step that distinguished itself from all the previous experiences. “The previous successful experiences of the Army and the GS, especially the last step taken in 2009 with the female implemented at the airport are the main reasons that pushed for women recruitment in the ISF. These successful initiatives paved the way for the ISF” (Ziyad Baroud, personal communication, November 13, 2012).

The Army first started the recruitment process in 1989 but officially announced women’s presence in 1991. The nature of the work was limited to desk jobs, however. Female participation made a new step but it was yet another limited initiative.

The most important measure affecting the ISF is the previous successful internal experience. The two female members aforementioned accomplished a lot and made a positive impact making the ISF a better institution. They both worked in different fields shifting away from the concept of desk jobs and they have managed to realize several important achievements. Major Hajj accomplished a lot especially being voted Police Woman of the Year by the International Association of Women Police in 2010. This was a positive experience that exposed Lebanon worldwide in a positive and professional way. Major Hajj and Captain Mehtar make real the positive experience that encouraged the ISF directorate as well as in a way deprived the ISF from excuses towards committing this step. “Dyala and I were present in every committee regarding the recruitment as well as there in every step of the way. Our previous successful experience paved the way for the new female cadets.” (Major Suzanne Hajj, personal communication, November 24, 2012). Captain Mehtar explains “My career was a distinguished experience. I crossed a lot of people that did not accept women lieutenants and did not believe in their capacity. But luckily through Suzanne and my successful experience, we were able to change this perception” (Captain Dyala Mehtar, personal communication, November 26, 2012). Furthermore, the General Directorate was responsive to the change especially General Commander Rifi who was the main encourager of this initiative and determined to have women in full participation in the ISF and not restrained to desk
jobs. The success of their work led the ISF to grant Major Hajj the responsibility of heading the Dbayeh Female Academy. She was in charge of 16 officers, 60 male sergeants and policemen (no ranks) as well as 197 female cadets. This initiative was the first of its kind in Lebanon, it did not occur nor in the Army nor in the GS previously. It was considered the first time in the Middle East where a woman was in charge of a training academy.

4.4 Political reasons behind recruitment:

Women’s recruitment is not a recent topic for the ISF. According to Major Hajj, the recruitment process started in 2005 when the door for applicants was opened and was followed by the testing phase. This initiative was stopped due the several political reasons. The assassination period and bombings were the highlight of 2005, followed by the 2006 war that paralyzed the country. Circumstances were not in favor of this initiative and kept delaying the timing of this reform. After the 2006 war, the country suffered from a period of political instability and major volatility. The constant political earthquakes, the troubles in street whether by the use of weapons or road blockage and the political vacancy and formation of new cabinets were all the main focus for the country. Even the training mission related to the ISF was also fought and opposed by certain political parties. The ISF missions were not always cheered for by everyone. In different circumstances, the mission was threatened by being terminated due to political reasons and several political objections. The ISF becoming a strong national security unit does not suit everybody’s interest thus measures regarding the improvements of the national police were hard to achieve. After year 2005, the focus on the ISF became revealed. On an international and local level, the attitude and measures were taken in order to empower the Lebanese police. The first measures taken were regarding specific training and equipment of the ISF. It was only in 2011, that the General directorate after a great effort started the testing process leading to the first female training academies in 2012. The political reasons always took the lead in the Lebanese interest. The ISF fought its way during these hard times trying to improve itself when nobody believed in its ability. The ISF tended to work in the shades of the Army due to political reasons that were dominant in the previous times. The ISF noted very few improvements in the 1990s considering the big steps that were taken starting 2005.
ISF’s commitment to change has been clearer since 2005. Women’s recruitment in the ISF is a historical step for this security pillar. The reasons leading to these improvements may be one or all the causes stated in this chapter. Even though some would attribute the date regarding the commitment to change as purely political, after studying deeply the several factors another approach can be conceived. In the next chapter we will offer a detailed analysis of the findings leading to a possible answer regarding the timing as well as the prospects of this vital step.
CHAPTER FIVE

PROSPECTS

The future regarding this historical step could be considered ambiguous. In this chapter, an explanation regarding the prospects of the recruitment of women will be elaborated. The ISF, the Lebanese society and the government each have a different approach regarding the topic. The analyses of this chapter will mainly be based on surveys conducted in order to reach as an accurate answer to the key research question as possible.

5.1 Prospects on the ISF level:

The ISF is the first entity affected by women’s recruitment. Lebanon as a patriarchal country affects the ISFs mentality. The unique situation of the two women present in a male dominant institution, created a confusing approach for the ISF. It is essential to evaluate the general mentality regarding the ISF members towards women’s recruitment as well as evaluate the lieutenants’ approach of the first training academy. In 2001, the ISF witnessed the inclusion of the first two women on the force. It was only ten years later that the ISF initiated a follow-up step concerning this matter. The mentality regarding a female presence in 2001 was very different and less encouraging towards this step. “I faced different challenges in the force especially being the first to be recruited in the ISF. The major challenges were the rejection of several members of the presence of a female officer as well as the undermining of women skills. But through the good performance of our job we were able to change this dominating mentality” (Captain Dyala Mehtar, personal communication, November 26, 2012). Major Hajj and Captain Mehtar believe that during their lonely ten year experience, they contributed in paving the way for the new female recruits.

The second phase of women’s recruitment could be considered as accomplished since the training phase is completed and police women are already
assigned and working in the field. Furthermore, the ISF is preparing for the next female training classes, which are scheduled to start in the beginning of 2013.

In order to be able to evaluate the situation, a questionnaire was distributed on 80 ISF members from different ranks, areas of origin and stations; 60 questionnaires were completed and returned to me. This questionnaire created a baseline for the evaluation of the ISF member’s level of acceptance and evaluation of the situation. A sample of the questionnaire is available in annex 1.
Appendix 1

Name:

Rank:

Hometown:

Years in service:

Currently positioned:

1. Do you encourage the presence of women in the ISF?

2. How would you evaluate the impact of this step?

3. Do you think women are capable of delivering the same quality of work in the field?

4. Would you trust working with a female partner?

5. What do you consider the biggest challenge regarding this step?
The questionnaires yielded interesting insights into the reception of women in the ISF. The table below organizes the responses, which will be analyzed further in the chapter.

Table 5.1: Response of ISF members interviewed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Mixed feelings</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Encouraging women presence according to years of service</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• 1 to 5 years (45.6%)</td>
<td>25 out of 60</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• 6 to 10 years (21.6%)</td>
<td>11 out of 60</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>2 out of 60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• 11 to 20 years (18.3%)</td>
<td>8 out of 60</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>3 out of 60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• 20 years and plus (18.3%)</td>
<td>3 out of 60</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>8 out of 60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Same level of performance</td>
<td>31 out of 60</td>
<td>10 out of 60</td>
<td>19 out of 60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust in field work</td>
<td>41 out of 60</td>
<td>11 out of 60</td>
<td>8 out of 60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results showed that the majority of the ISF is encouraging and welcoming of this new step. Forty-seven out of 60 are encouraging for women’s recruitment in the force. Furthermore, 31 believe that women are capable of performing the same job and outcome as men as well as 41 members state that they would trust women in the field. The majority of the policemen that discourage the presence of women are the old ISF generation that benefited from six to more than twenty years of service. Furthermore, what is intriguing is that several of the men discouraging women presence in the ISF, answered that they would trust women in the field depending on their qualifications. The high rate regarding the trust matters offers a window of hope regarding people refuting this step. The rationale will be explored later in this chapter highlighting the results of the findings. This questionnaire offers not only quantitative data but also qualitative information that helps in determining the
reasons behind this step, the advantages and disadvantages as well as the obstacles harming this initiative.

According to the policemen interviewed the main reasons leading to the welcome of female recruitment are diverse and include:

- The job requires the presence of women in several matters;
- The previous successful experiences on the local and regional level might have been ameliorated by the presence of women in the ISF;
- The worldwide progress that leads to women empowerment and reaching gender equality
- Imitation of the West even though the Lebanese mentality is different
- The American mission and the community policing training
- Women are no longer framed by the housewife picture
- To improve the ISF’s performance
- The rise of women terrorist or women criminals which requires women to search them.

In addition to this, several policemen believe that this step will present several advantages for the ISF. The arguments used are:

- Women will facilitate searches of female suspects, work in the prisons as well as deal with crimes and investigations
- The increase of the ISF members’ number in order to perform a better job
- The ISF will become more professional and less affected by corruption
- This will be a real example of gender equality
- New job opportunities for Lebanese women
- Lebanese women will have the chance to be active in the security sector and prove their talents in a new field.

The answers regarding the disadvantages and the obstacles were very similar. The majority of the policemen questioned believed that women are not as physically fit as men and thus cannot perform the same in certain fields. Police work is prone to danger and therefore women will be exposed to danger, fatigue, and exhaustion that, given their weaker body constitution, will be challenging to address another main issue that was addressed is regarding the public reaction. Most policemen believe
that the public will not respond to a female policewoman. Furthermore, women’s recruitment is evaluated as negative impact on male recruitment. Some believe that it will reduce men’s employment opportunities as well as increase male unemployment rates. Several other issues were mentioned as sexual harassment, supervisors with patriarchal values and night shifts.

The ISF directorate, already aware of the obstacles presented, is dealing with the challenges gradually. For instance, women’s shifts end at 20:00 except for the women working at the airport who actually work on night shifts. Moreover while women are being distributed to all department after evaluating their skills, the ISF officially has created the first female special force unit. The directorate action plan is based on short-term as well as long-term goals to be achieved. Women’s recruitment is not a project that occurs overnight, it is considered as an ongoing progressive measure. In addition to those measures, the ISF is drafting a sexual harassment law as well as several officers are working on suggestions project to deal with internal problems. One of the projects proposed is entitled the “Red Police” and was proposed in order to deal with all the different internal conflicts in order to prevent future problems.

As seen above, the questionnaire’s outcome offers in general a positive analysis of the situation. It shows us that even with the disadvantages present, a global acceptance and encouragement environment is dominant. Another questionnaire was addressed to the female training officers available in annex 2.
Appendix 2
Female training officers Questionnaire

Name: 
Rank: 
Hometown: 
Years in service: 
Currently positioned:
  1) Do you think the implementation of women in the ISF is successful so far?

  2) What is in your own opinion regarding the advantages and disadvantages of this step?

  3) Do you think this will have a positive improvement for the ISF’s image?

  4) Recently, you as training officers went down to the street with the women for patrols. What was the reaction of the public when they first saw the women on the street?

  5) Why do you think this policy was created?

  6) Do you think women are capable of delivering the same quality of work in the field?
Fifteen officers and sergeants from different training academies filled out the questionnaire. The outcome shows that the fifteen answered positively regarding the training and female presence in the ISF. The questionnaire answers offer better insight regarding the training situation. These officers and sergeants are the ones conducting the training thus they are in a unique position to provide an evaluation of the situation. The great surprise regarding the analyses of the answers is that they all offered the same positive outcome. The measure is considered as successful by the unanimity of the ISF interrogated. “I believe the implementation of women in the ISF has been successful so far. The women have risen up to meet all the challenges of the occasion equally. They have demonstrated exquisite discipline as well as solid determination and perseverance in defying all the targets set ahead of them” (ISF lieutenant, 2012).

Moreover, the advantages and disadvantages conquer the reasons presented in the first questionnaire. The American deputy contingent commander of the Dbayeh academy that also trained the female recruits expressed her positive evaluation of the situation. In an interview with the daily star Tanya Gonser stated “Physically, they have shown they can do everything that the men can do, and academically, they are doing superbly” (Daily Star, 2012). In addition to that, the training team believes that women recruitment is an essential step in order to obtain a real democratic policing system. This step was evaluated as a positive impact on the ISF’s image. “I have no doubt that enrolling women in ISF will improve its image accordingly. Community policing is achieved when a true partnership, between ISF from one side and the society from the other side, is built. This partnership is governed by earned trust of the society and by mutual respect between both sides. [The] presence of police women in our society without any doubt will enhance more faith in the ISF, more respect for them and more tranquility in the hearts of the citizens” (ISF lieutenant, 2012).

“As previously mentioned 41 out of 60 people questioned in the first questionnaire stated their trust of women in the field. This high rate coincides with the training team’s beliefs. All of the officers and sergeants questioned believe that women can be trusted in the field and deliver the same quality of work. One of the officers interviewed elaborated the situation with a great
approach. “In the USA, women usually disparage the thought that they be treated differently during military drills, considering it to be discrimination against women. Therefore, women in order to prove themselves have to work much harder than men, and have to leave their comfort zones and look at things from a vastly different perspective. Knowing that society highly provokes women by prejudging their capabilities, they tend to exert more effort before their goals to achieve paramount value. With motivation, will, action, ambition and the right attitude, I’m certain that they will not only deliver the same quality of work as men, but they might surpass them taking into consideration that ability is gender independent. In addition, Police women in other countries have proven they are capable of delivering the same quality of work in the field. As a result, I believe Lebanese women possess the ability to deliver such efficiency, since they are well trained at the academy” (ISF lieutenant, 2012).

The ISF’s general response to the recruitment of women is considered to be positive. The advantages presented by the people interviewed outweigh all the disadvantages presented. However, a large number of ISF member still believe that women’s recruitment is a bad initiative and have objections to their presence in the field. The new generations of male sergeants that have been recruited during the past year are mostly university students. These new recruits benefit from a more modern mentality that does not discriminate against women in the force. The problem mostly lies with the ISF’s older generation who refuse this progress. Since the ISF directorate is committed to this step, this initiative remains strong. Furthermore, the training officers and sergeants believe in the positive impact of this step as well as the training delivered. These two factors contribute in guarantying the commitment to the success of this step.

5.2 Prospects at the society level:

Lebanese society is a haven of multicultural mentalities. Female recruitment in the ISF has been a controversial issue long discussed. One of the main obstacles was society’s reaction to this initiative. As previously noted, the mixture of liberal and conservative values defines women’s identity in the country. The first trial for the Lebanese society occurred in 2009 where the GS implemented women at the
airport. The public’s reaction was positive, and a smooth transition occurred in contradiction to the general expectations.

During the security month in June 2012, the ISF directorate conducted the first field work attempt for the female recruits. In the questionnaire given to the training officers, there was a question regarding people’s first reaction. “The public was surprised to see police women on the street. However, I did hear many people congratulating them for their bravery and their courageous decision to enroll themselves in the ISF. Moreover, they did encourage them to continue what they started and to prove to the prejudiced people that gender discrimination is based on false accusations” (ISF lieutenant, 2012).

In order to establish a better grasp of the situation, a random survey was conducted with the public in order to evaluate their reaction after seeing the female ISF in the streets. The survey was filled out by fifty people randomly picked after first encountering women in the streets. The study is based on a sample that regroups female and male from all ages. The random choice of people was made on purpose to evaluate everybody’s opinion towards the topic. The survey is available in annex 3.
Appendix 3

1) What was your first reaction when you encountered female ISF members in the streets?
2) Do you think it is a positive initiative?
3) Do you think it will have a positive improvement for the ISF? Why?
4) Do you think women are capable of delivering the same quality of work in the field [as men]?
The answers to the questionnaire were very positive. The table below lays out the responses.

Table 5.2: public’s reaction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Positive reaction</th>
<th>Negative reaction</th>
<th>Mixed reaction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What was your first reaction when you encountered female ISF members in the streets?</td>
<td>34 believed it was a very positive experience and they were positively surprised</td>
<td>13 discouraged this step and hoped to see it reversed</td>
<td>3 have mixed feelings regarding the topic and are waiting to see the results.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you think it is a positive initiative?</td>
<td>35 yes</td>
<td>13 no</td>
<td>2 will wait to see the outcome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you think it will have a positive impact on the ISF?</td>
<td>35 yes</td>
<td>13 no</td>
<td>2 will wait to see the outcome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you think women are capable of delivering the same quality of work in the field?</td>
<td>31 yes</td>
<td>18 no</td>
<td>2 maybe</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

While 50 responses—even when randomly sampled—do not make a representative sample for all of Lebanon, the results can be viewed as indicative. The results show that a majority of those polled find women’s recruitment as a positive step that improves the ISFs image. Thirty-four out of 50 encourage this step which indicated that 68 percent is in favor of this initiative. Three out of 50 are confused regarding the initiative and are waiting to see the outcome before evaluating the situation. On the other hand, some citizens believe that this step is a bad decision taken by the ISF headquarters: 26 percent rejected this step and believe it will lead to a failed experience for the ISF. For instance, a policewoman on the street was once stopped by a man and yelled regarding his personal point of view that women should not be
in the ISF in the field. He believed that the country is suffering from unemployment and that women are diminishing men’s chances of getting a job.

If we accept these results as indicative, then it means that somewhere around 50 percent of the society believes in this step and in the potential for women to perform well in the field. Several policewomen mentioned that they were congratulated by the public when stumbled upon in the streets. The general directorate announces that the female police did not encounter major problems with the public in the field. The nature of the problems were similar to those faced by men in the ISF and were considered ISF-related and only a few gender-related comments were recorded.

Furthermore, the media played a fundamental part by positively promoting this measure. Local news channels such as MTV, LBCI, Al-Jadeed, Al-Arabiya, conducted several documentaries aired during the primetime news. Local newspapers such as The Daily Star and L’Orient-Le Jour covered this step showing the development of training. The media shed the light on the professional training and the high physical performance of the women. Several letters of congratulations were addressed to the ISF directorate as well to training officers personally.

In conclusion, the public generally seemed to embrace the step taken by the ISF to recruit women to its ranks. The positive surprise and encouragement seemed greater than the negative reactions to ISF recruitment of women. Any decision taken in the world is encouraged by some and opposed by others. This case revealed a similar reaction but the public seems to lean more towards this change in policy as a positive one.

5.3 Prospects at the Government Level:

The step of women’s recruitment into the ISF has been encouraged by the ISF directorate, the public, and the government. The government supported the ISF’s decision and offered its assistance in implementing it. Furthermore, the prospects for the improvement of the situation of women in Lebanon look promising at a more general level. On December 11, 2012, the parliament in collaboration with the United Nations Development Programme announced The Lebanese National Human Rights
Action Plan in a ceremony. This action plan was the result of seven years of work, targeting the modification and improvements of 21 topics and their laws. The laws discussed are mainly related to women’s rights. A section is specifically addressed to women issues in the action plan. In addition to this, the action plan includes reforms related to security matters that directly affect the ISF, such as fundamentals regarding arrests and interrogations, prisons, the death penalty and many others. This plan offers a better situation for women in general as well as women in the security sector. If and when this action plan is voted on, it will guarantee the improvement of women’s reality in Lebanon on several levels. The announcement of the action plan, as well as the UNDP and parliament’s commitment to it, offers a hopeful future for women.

This chapter offers us a window of hope regarding women’s future in the force. Every step taken faces its obstacles but only the future holds the guarantee of its success. The indicators so far are positive and promising towards this significant step. This chapter is an attempt for finding answers. The small sample makes the work none conclusive but offers a window of interpretation to the situation.
CHAPTER SIX

CONCLUSION

6.1 General findings and conclusions

The thesis has offered a detailed explanation regarding the ISF, mapping problems and factors affecting its performance. Women’s recruitment has marked a new chapter in the ISF’s book. The reasons leading to this step could be caused by the several factors stated previously in the chapters. The foreign assistance programs contributed in terms of training the ISF members as well as presenting donations and equipments in order to better perform their job. In addition, the ISF suffered from performance problems due to the women’s absence in the field. This necessity, accompanied with the successful experience of the two female members encouraged the General Directorate to pursue women’s recruitment in the agency. The political sphere affected the ISF’s timing for the recruitment. The initial recruitment was scheduled to start in 2005. The combination of those several factors led to women being recruited in the ISF in 2011. The surveys previously mentioned validate the factors behind this step. The 2005 general directorate’s recruitment decision was only put in order recently after the political reasons complemented by the other factors allowed it. The ISF has proved its commitment to change by modernizing the training and working on the curriculum. The code of conduct is another commitment towards the path of change. Furthermore, the ISF showed its engagement by committing to rehabilitating ISF members by undergoing training with the American mission. This general atmosphere shows a will to change and develop. Women recruitment is considered the most recent and important decision adopted by the ISF crowning its path of development.

6.2 Is Lebanon undergoing security sector reform?

The Internal Security Forces still suffers gravely from internal problems accentuated by the external factors harming its development. The economical situation in the country is a factor that affects the ISF performance. The requirements
to apply to the ISF are less than basics. During the training academies more than 90 percent of the cadets answered that they applied because the ISF offers a steady job with social security benefits. A new ISF recruit with no ranks receives a salary approximate to 980,000 LL as for the sergeants the amount results 1,189,000 LL per month. The ISF code of conduct states that any member of the ISF is not allowed to have any other job during the years of service. The ISF members are prone to corruption to make ends means. The insufficient equipment, inadequate staff and outdated rules and regulations are major internal issues the ISF is dealing with. The new training programs accompanied with the foreign assistance donations as well as development of curriculums, are all steps towards dealing with these issues.

The real problem lies in the rivalry of the security sector and its political dependence. The army, GS and ISF should complement each other’s work instead of creating a rivalry ambiance harming their work. In addition to that the political instability is the main element affecting the ISF’s performance. The series of murders affected the ISF causing the loss of several members in their ranks. Some could interpret that Lebanon is undergoing a security sector reform where women’s recruitment is another proof of the reform. By UN standards, a successful SSR must be accompanied by gender integration in the progress. In addition to that if we evaluate the criteria set by the UN for a country to undergo SSR, we will find that Lebanon meets several of the requirements. The ISF is currently promoting human rights, integrating gender into the whole process, assessing the need of the agency. The UK conducted in March 2008 a strategic review of the ISF. This step is one of the essential tools of security sector reform according to UN standards. The UN standards’ model states that an SSR is to be “implemented step-by-step when global SSR is impossible due to a very weak state (Lebanon, Palestine) and where community or sectarian tensions prevent a national consensus on SSR. Furthermore the UN guidelines states that the initiative should be based on a national decision. The Lebanese government signed their commitment to change when they signed several agreements like for instance the ISF’s foreign trainings. Women in the security sector crowned by the recruitment of women in the ISF are considered as gender sensitive approach. In addition, Lebanon benefits from the presence of UN peacekeepers after the withdrawal of the Israeli forces. In comparison to the
guidelines specified by the UN, Lebanon meets several of the conditions defined. But these conditions are limited in the Lebanese case.

Still, the ISF suffers from lack of coordination between donors and training. Several training conducted overlapped and even leading to rivalry between donors. The UK’s initiative to create a bureau of donor coordination as well as strategy initiative was in vain. Furthermore, Belloncle believes “that realistic and sustainable SSR initiatives need to start with the acknowledgement of the limits of the context of Lebanese politics, both with regard to internal and external dimensions.” (Belloncle, 2006, p. 1) He elaborates by explaining “domestic reforms are largely and necessarily in the Lebanese’s hands, the international community can and must act on Lebanese external environment to encourage and facilitate the implementation of SSR in the country. This requires acknowledgment of Lebanon’s need for external security. Indeed, in the absence of pressure from all regional power, Israel included, it is unlikely that any attempt to implement SSR in the country will avoid being perceived as an attempt to interfere in Lebanese politics and security.” (Belloncle, 2006, p. 1)

Lebanon also suffers from the spreading of armed forces. The presence of armed units outside the government makes any SSR initiative an endeavor and even impossibility to achieve. The political involvement of the security sector in Lebanon is another major obstacle to SSR. The political influence of each security agency in Lebanon is very clear. The American approach of war on terrorism is very clear and it is part of her motive for her donor implication in Lebanon. Hezbollah on many attempts tried to fight to missions training in Lebanon and even trying to stop the decisions. This political fragility shows the lack of national consensus on security reform as well as local agreements on the country’s future strategies. The unique nature of Lebanon makes it hard to evaluate. The UN guidelines as well as most security sector reform theories states that an SSR should be tailored to each country’s nature. Lebanon meets most of the requirements constituting an SSR but highlighted by several obstacles limiting its effectiveness. Women recruitment is yet another proof of Lebanon trying to commit to SSR. The uniqueness of the Lebanese case and its ongoing internal conflict is leading Lebanon towards a fragmented SSR.

6.3 Future Prospects

The future for the ISF seems promising since change has been adopted. Women’s recruitment is considered as a double edge sword. The failure of this step will harm the ISF’s image that has been a target of improvement. On the other hand
the success of this step will guarantee internal and external improvements. As mentioned previously the women benefit from high degrees of education which is a qualitative change within the ISF. Most of the female members benefit from higher educational level than the ones required. In addition to that the surveys established open a window of hope regarding the future. A female sergeant called Nivine Horro was interviewed by the daily star regarding her new experience. She expressed herself by saying “I’ve already experienced so many things that I just never thought I would be able to. The training was really hard because we were apart from our families and the training was also difficult, so it was physically and emotionally challenging. But then we made this transition from a civilian to a police officer, and everything became easier.” The spirit of the new female recruits is one of the most essential indicators for the future. It is with new members proud and happy to be part of the ISF that future hides hope for the ISF. In addition to that Minister Baroud explained in an interview that women are less prone to Corruption. Lebanon’s corruption index in 2011 was ranked 134 with a value equal to 2.5 (0 being the most corrupted). In 2012, Lebanon ranked 128 with a corruption index equal 30 (0 being the most corrupt). Women’s presence could have contributed in the amelioration of the situation, leaving a window of hope for the future. The future of the ISF and the Lebanese security sector is hard to predetermine based on the country’s situation. The political frivolity, deep division of the Lebanese society and armed clashed do not project a promising future for SSR. But the uniqueness of the Lebanese case never stops to surprise us in unexpected times.
Bibliography


http://www.securitycouncilreport.org/atf/cf/%7B65BFCF9B-6D27-4E9C-8CD3-CF6E4FF96FF9%7D/supportingsecurity[1].pdf

http://www.securitycouncilreport.org/atf/cf/%7B65BFCF9B-6D27-4E9C-8CD3-CF6E4FF96FF9%7D/supportingsecurity[1].pdf


http://www.mei.nus.edu.sg/publications/lebanon-a-case-of-political-instability

Global Justice Center. (2007, September). *Unequal access to justice in the Middle East. Human rights through the rule of law (Fact Sheet)*. Retrieved from the Global Justice Center website:


Scientific and Cultural Organization website:


www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/public/eWPS.pdf

Carnegie Middle East Center website: 

http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/publisher,FREEHOU,,LBN,47387b6c2f,0.html
Appendix list of interviews


2. Chelleri Ricardo, SAROL Project Manager in Lebanon, interviewed by author, April 4 2013, Khaldeh, Lebanon.

3. Deutscher Andre, Chief technical adviser of the SAROL in Lebanon, interviewed by author, April 4 2013, Khaldeh, Lebanon.


