

Inclusion and Early Childhood Education

Zahraa Nesser

Reine Mouzannar

Lebanese American University

15/05/2021

Research Purpose

The early years of a child's life are critical to their future success and happiness. Many have heard of someone that has a special need, whether it's a visible or an invisible disability. But we as researchers had never previously thought of the difficulties they face through their education from the very early years. It is not that they can't perform the same as people with non special needs but special needs people need professional help to do so. Furthermore, not all countries have that specific curricular approaches to establishing inclusive classrooms that effectively help support the learning of disabled people. The purpose of this research is to compare the different approaches used in Lebanon and other countries regarding inclusive early education. We hope that our research can help readers understand more about effective inclusive education that meets the needs of learners with disabilities., This will be attained by comparing inclusive early childhood education curricula from different countries.

Research Questions

This study will be guided by the following research questions:

- What different approaches of ECE are used by international organizations to promote inclusion?
- Why is it difficult to sustain an inclusive education in low income countries like Lebanon?

Key Literature

In the article *Early Childhood Inclusion in the United States* Guralnick and Bruder (2016) state their purpose was to discuss the goals and history of how inclusive classrooms in the early years started up until today and the future directions. About 700 studies were conducted through interviews, surveys and observational trials in 30 years (Bailey, 2000), and most of the studies

showed that there is a huge positive effect of inclusive classrooms where learners with special needs are put in the same program as learners without special needs. This study posits that there are four key goals used to enhance an early childhood classroom: access, accommodations and feasibility, developmental progress, and social integration. This article reanalyzes the four goals using examples of new programs. The last part of this article includes recommendations to improve the effectiveness of early childhood inclusive classrooms in the United States.

In the article *Attitudes of teachers and head teachers towards inclusion in Lebanon* Khochen and Radford's (2012) purpose was to explore the attitudes of teachers and the head teachers in Lebanon towards students with special needs and disabilities in the early childhood program and primary years. The study uses the mixed-method approach to collect data. About forty teachers from ordinary schools within The National Inclusion Project (NIP) filled out questionnaires and many head teachers were interviewed. The study involved teachers from schools within the NIP because they had previous history with students with special needs. The results showed a positive effect on students with special needs when placed in ordinary schools with non-special needs students. Also, there were many challenges reported in the findings of the study most were a lack of teachers with experience and knowledge of how to deal with special needs students and the cost of an inclusive classroom was extremely high.

In the article "Early Childhood Inclusion in Spain" the authors' Gine et al (2016) purpose was to describe early childhood inclusion in classrooms in Spain. First, they discuss the meaning of early childhood education and state the cycles of it in Spain. They then examine the current state of early childhood inclusion in Spain and analyze some relevant issues. Topics such as teacher training for students with special needs, forms of schooling, and curriculum are covered. Thirdly, a short summary of the evaluation of a research is discussed. In the final part of the

article, the main challenges faced by Spanish early education are examined and the steps required for the future such as involving the family with the teachers and teacher training. In Spain, very little research has been done so there a call to organizations to attempt more effort on research so that inclusive classrooms becomes a reality for as many learners as possible.

In this article “Early Childhood Inclusion in Taiwan” Liao & Wu (2017) discuss the history of Taiwan’s early childhood intervention up until the present. They examine the acts taken to protect the educational rights of special needs learners until the Peoples with Disabilities Rights Protection Act (2007) and the Child and Youth Welfare and Protection (2012) stated that no ordinary learning institution can reject a learner with special needs enrollment in regular classes. The authors also discuss the current early childhood inclusion practices and policies. Researchers in Taiwan study how inclusive classrooms effect the development of children with special needs. They found out that the more time special needs learners spent with non-special needs learners the better the social interaction between the students is. The article also discusses the challenges at the national level and the community level the Taiwanese culture faces. And it describes the future steps that should be taken to enhance the early childhood inclusion in Taiwan.

Data Analysis

In our research, we will be using document analysis. Document analysis is a type of qualitative research which focuses on searching documents by the reviewer to examine an appraisal topic. Document analysis involves coding the content of subjects documents in the same ways as one does with interview transcripts or observations. This type of analysis will help us look into detail of the different approaches of early childhood education used in more than one country. Moreover, it will help us with investigating the unpleasant and genuine strategies used

while integrating inclusion into early childhood classroom instructions. This data found in the articles we chose will help us compare early childhood inclusion education in Lebanon versus other known countries. In addition, we will be using scholarly articles tackling the issue of early childhood inclusion in Lebanon, Spain, the United States, and Taiwan.

Timeline

The whole research will take up to three months to be finished. First, the Research Plan will be done in a one-week duration. It will include all information regarding the research articles included, data analysis, research purpose, and research question(s). Literature Review will be finished in three weeks' duration. It will incorporate relevant publications to the topic, explaining what we as researchers found and critically analyzing them. Furthermore, Data Collection and Analysis will be done in three weeks' duration. In which we will be collecting data from articles, measuring them if needed, and analyzing the results using the chosen technique. Moreover, Term Paper will be done in three weeks duration. Finally, Poster Presentation will be done in a one-week phase.

Literature Review

In this literature review we will be presenting a number of research studies to the topic of approach used with learners having special needs in early childhood education. The articles covered show how several countries deal with inclusion differently, especially in early childhood education. Articles presented are mostly qualitative research articles. These articles were analyzed to help us to understand what research has previously been done regarding inclusive education so that we can identify a gap in the current research. Additionally, this literature

review will help to inform our own research questions. And based upon this literature review we can see a gap in the research relating to inclusion in Lebanese schools.

The first source was from Mutabbakani and Callinan (2020) who explored the different perspectives of autistic children's mothers regarding their kids' inclusive early childhood education in Kuwait. The researchers used a qualitative approach, the participants were chosen using a snowball sampling technique to enroll various samples of socio-demographic traits. Focus group and individual semi-structured interviews were conducted with (n = 34) Kuwaiti mothers of children with autism, where the sample size was deduced based on theoretical saturation. Moreover, the sample aimed to share the different experiences and perspectives of mothers who have autistic children registered at a kindergarten level, the factors that shaped such perceptions, and the role that mothers play in advocating for their children's right to inclusive education was also explored. In addition, participants had varied educational settings, the interviewees did not share a common understanding of inclusion. However, the issues that appeared from the interviews demonstrated that the general opinion amongst the mothers who participated is that the same inclusive educational criterion will not fulfill all autistic children's needs. This research shows how inclusive education is performed differently and thought of differently among a group with children of the same condition. Thus, showing how parents play a major role in the educational field of their children's inclusive learning. Such aspect relates to identifying the correct way to perform practices and how to raise awareness in people with children of special needs. This relates to how many parents have a vague understanding of their kids' special needs especially in Lebanon, which affects the education they're providing to the young in need learners.

Majako (2018) examines the effectiveness of inclusive and special teaching in early childhood education in Zimbabwe. The research methodology used is interpretive qualitative, and included intervals of interviews where each educator was asked to draw on their inclusive classroom experiences. Moreover, the sample constituted of 21 teachers, 12 inclusive primary school teachers, and 9 special schoolteachers who taught grade one to two classes. 13 of the teachers had extra qualification in special needs education. The findings are all related to disabled children in inclusive or special school classrooms. The findings revealed 8 themes which are: diagnosis-informed placement, diagnosis-informed pedagogy, teacher-made assessments, learner-responsive pedagogy, diverse teaching strategies, methods and techniques, behavior management, collaboration and advocacy. Altogether, participants displayed a professional base in teaching and learning of children with disabilities, although they exhibited an absence of mastery to teach disabled children and govern some children with behavioral challenges. Furthermore, this article allows advancement to occur in education, it is important to not only look at educational aspects but also the society which greatly influences educational outcomes. This study is essential for our study as it allows us to understand the different approaches taken by different countries and compare them to the Lebanese special needs curriculums.

Hamaidi, Homidi, and Reyes (2012) describe in their study, early childhood educators' perceptions and attitudes towards academic, social, and emotional aspects of inclusion practices. The practices involve the development of the law that learners with disabilities should be given schooling in the slightest restrictive environments. They believed that a teacher's personal beliefs and practices play a significant role in the development of children. It is a comparative research and attitudinal demographic survey, using a quantitative research design. The researchers

used an inferential statistic methodology. They distributed 300 questionnaire surveys demographically to early childhood educators in instructed kindergartens and primary public schools in urban areas of Jordan, United Arab Emirates, and U.S.A. to answer the four hypotheses suggested by the authors. These statistics were based on the negative and positive attitudes toward inclusive education. One of the hypothesis reduced was: There is no substantial connection between teachers' positive attitude towards social and emotional facets and the demographic variables. As a result, the study findings emphasized that the general behaviors toward social and emotional aspects of inclusion notion were favorable. The teachers conveyed identical purposes and values concerning the equity that can be attained in the quality inclusive classroom. But when it comes to practice there was a gap between the theory of inclusive education and the existing practices which are affected by economic components, especially in Jordan and the UAE. This gap negatively influenced the sufficient aids that are desired to accomplish successful inclusive strategies. This research shows that more efforts are needed to link the gap between the beliefs and the practices of inclusion. To allow improvement to occur in education, it is important to not only look at educational aspects, but also the practices and beliefs which greatly influence educational outcomes.

Yagata (2019) argues how individualized education and early intervention, are increasingly pervasive globally but may not be performed in significant ways. The study was conducted in Japan and used a qualitative research design with interviews conducted by the Hoikuen director Saito-sensei (pseudonym). This conversation will be used as a starting point for suggesting how early childhood educators, teachers, and researchers across the planet might captivate from diverse practices in education to challenge increasingly systematic theories of intervention. Through Yagata's research she formulated two key themes that appear to shape

Saito- sensei's ideology and approach: 1) deliberate non-intervention is action and 2) intervention is naturalistic, embodied, and including the whole class. The authors concluded that all children in a classroom are capable of benefitting from an activity targeted to help one child. and that dealing with everyone the same does not indicate a presumption that each child has the same conditions, strengths, or deficiencies and would sustain from a one approach fits all sort of education. Such information is essential knowledge for our research as it allows us to understand the most benefitting structure of curriculum for students.

Agbenyega & Klibthong (2014) purpose of research was to assess Thai early childhood teachers' proficiency and readiness to teach in inclusive programs. The research used a mixed-methods research design. Quantitative data were collected through a questionnaire completed by 175 teachers (6 males and 169 females) and semi-structured interviews were conducted in 11 public and 12 private inclusive early childhood centers that enroll disabled children. The results showed 65.7% of teachers did not take courses in inclusive education but were teaching in programs. 11.5% indicated that they have a close family member or friend with a disability, not impacting their profession a knowledge. 44% have taught children with disabilities of which 26% knew. Of the 175 participants, 95.4% would like to learn more about inclusive practices and Development. 81 participants were not sure if they are confident or not to teach children with disabilities. This advocates teachers' overall development and focuses on a teacher's different approaches and strategies used.

Hilbert's (2014) aim in writing his/her article was to recognize parents and child characteristics that impact parents who have children attending inclusive educational programs. The study focuses on the programs that impact learners' knowledge of inclusion and inclusive preschool programs in the USA. The author conducted quantitative research with 149 parents of

children with and without disabilities, ages 6 months to 6 years. These participants attended one of seven inclusive preschool programs in Alabama (1 program), Colorado (1 program), Oklahoma (1 program) and Texas (4 programs) answered a survey of 120 questions. This qualitative research conducted relied on parent tuition, private donations, and fundraising. The results of the research showed that parents of children with disabilities were less likely to support an inclusive program that assisted children with serious disabilities, such as autism and behavior disorders. Such information is essential knowledge for our research as it allows us to understand the different perceptions of parents regarding the inclusive education provided for their children.

Zabeli and Gjelij's (2020) wished to explore the different preschool teacher's inclusive education perceptions of the system that undergoes transitions and encounters substantial challenges overall. Further discussed, how these teachers believe about the procedure of involving children in the quality educational system and the challenges they futures face. Qualitative research was carried out to study respondent's experiences and express their attitudes in various ways. The sample used in this method is that of 10 skilled preschool teachers from several places of Kosovo who were interviewed using semi-structured in-depth meetings. As seen in Kosovo, the results showed how teachers have a common knowledge of inclusion but lack the proper skills for sufficient teaching strategies to work with children with special needs. Yet all participants considered inclusion as an essential classroom approach for all children and recommended financial investment to overcome such obstacles. This study is noteworthy in understanding how we should prepare our inclusive curriculums and how this affects children's readiness to move on to other classes. It also helps us to identify the importance of teacher preparedness for inclusive strategies in different countries.

Voss and Buffkin (2011) studied the importance of preparing early childhood and special education preservice educators for inclusive environments using a mixed-method approach. The number of participants from 2004 to 2009 were ranged from 20 to 25, while in 2010 a drop of participants was noted to 10. Moreover, the data collected was based on course activities, where preservice teachers participated as part of their coursework. The findings showed that preservice teachers with advanced inclusive field experiences improved their skills to become more comfortable working with students with special needs. This further enriched our research by indicating how the right experiences and practice can help in enriching inclusive educations

Zhang, Liu and Lin (2019) discuss in their study Chinese teacher's perception of the response to intervention (RTI model) implementation feasibility in the Chinese inclusive early childhood education. The authors used a qualitative research methodology and a total of 139 early childhood teachers and administrators from 31 schools in Nanjing participated in this study. Interviews were conducted about teacher's perceptions of RTI implementation feasibility in inclusive ECE in China. The results showed that although preschool educators had little knowledge about the RTI model, they had positive attitudes towards it and were ready to participate in learning about this model. However, some educators had negative attitudes towards the use of the model in China's situation. It is concluded that schools should focus more and improve inclusive education systems for early childhood education educators. Also, colleges and universities should also build up more knowledge about inclusive education and provide more learning opportunities.

Zhu, Li and Hsieh (2017) discuss in their study how inclusive education is implemented in preschools in China and it focuses on its benefits and challenges. This study was performed in a kindergarten that is well known in Hong Kong for its inclusive classrooms. 2 learners with

special needs were chosen for this study and data was collected through observation, interview and document analysis. The research design was qualitative and the results showed that the preschool chosen performed a variety of inclusive activities and practices such as programme background, school policy, peer support, individualized teaching and training. This research is essential to our study because it gives us information about a successful inclusive classroom and shares some challenges faced and how to approach them.

Hsieh, W and Hsieh, C (2011) investigate the connection between urban early childhood educator's attitudes towards inclusive education and individual characteristics, professional background and program context. The research methodology is quantitative and is performed through questionnaires that were done by 19 early childhood educators who teach in early childhood centers in low income urban neighborhoods. The results showed that none of the variables relating to demographic information of participants predicted overall attitude about inclusion. And some of the variables related to professional backgrounds are having a positive experience with special needs learners which have shown a positive attitude. The results of this research suggest some directions for future research, for example this is the first research that is done to address the attitudes between EC educators teaching in poor urban areas and a lot has to be done to further understand the impacts of different areas have on early childhood education inclusion.

Hollingsworth and Buysse (2009) aim of the study is to determine the importance of establishing friendships between classmates in early childhood inclusive classrooms. They believed that parents and teachers play a significant role in establishing friendship and they investigated in what way did they affect the friendship established. This qualitative study used semi-structured interviews and the participants were learners between the age of 3 – 6 years old,

parents, and teachers. The results indicated that some strategies, like setting up meeting among children, and engaging them in helping each other with school work, may have been preformed incidentally rather than intentionally. Most parents and teachers reported that the friendship was pleasant sounding and was based on positive play interactions. This study is important to our research, because it allows us to understand the importance of teacher and parent's role in providing friendship among kids with special needs and mainstream students in classrooms.

Akrim and Harfiani (2019) in their study aimed to analyze the daily learning flow of early childhood inclusive education. The research methodology is qualitative and data was collected through interviews, observations, document analysis and focus group discussions. The data collected is then analyzed using an interactive analysis model. The study was conducted in an inclusive school in west Jakarta. The participants in the study were the teaching staff, the principal and the coordinator in charge of inclusive classrooms. The results showed that the daily learning flow was in the form of pre-opener, opener, energizer, activity, linking and summarizing then review applied by RA. The authors believed it is necessary to modify the daily learning flow which is the flagship if RA school in Jakarta.

Sodak and Erwin (2000) used a qualitative research design to explore the viewpoints of parents of preschoolers with special needs, to understand the factors that shape their participation in their child's inclusive education. 10 parents of preschoolers with special needs who were in inclusive classrooms participated in this study and were interviewed. A conceptual framework of factors that influence parent participation was developed based on the themes that emerged from the data. The results showed that the parents participation is influenced by a number of factors such as the schools involved in inclusive activities and providing parents to be involved in decision making this ensures them that their opinions are respected. This study also suggests

that meaningful involvement for preschoolers as well as parents is a crucial component in inclusive education. This helps us understand the perspectives of parents regarding inclusive education.

As a conclusion, the literature review helped us investigate the different perspectives of inclusive education curriculums and its diverse applications in certain countries. The significance of such research has examined our understanding the different pedagogies applied in countries for special needs education compared to Lebanon. These studies foreground the concept of the different approaches to special need students in many countries. each country has a specific approach towards it and to several ideals of investigators. Comprehending the gap in contemplating Lebanon's lack of information about inclusive education, we are looking at inclusive approaches around different parts of the world. This gap will help us specify how Lebanon can use an approach to open doors for special needs students to experience inclusive education correctly.

Findings

Throughout the upcoming section, findings from our data collection will be discussed and presented. While some of our data were books, we didn't necessarily collect data from all the books instead we purposely focused on specific data-rich chapters that are related to our identified themes. Our Early Childhood Education (ECE) data is organized according to three specific themes that were inferred from our research question and induced from the research data. The first theme is the definition of Inclusive Education (IE), which is a deductive theme that discusses the different meanings and descriptions given by each program. The other deductive theme examines the rationale of Inclusion, which addresses the reasons why each program is talking and manifesting inclusive education. The third theme is the practices used to

create effective inclusive education, which discusses what systems are focusing on to create equal learning opportunities for all. For each theme, the programs will be presented in the respective order. Starting with Best Practices in Inclusive Education for Children with Disabilities: Applications for Program Design In the Europe & Eurasia Region, followed by Inclusive Education: The Way Of the Future, then Towards Inclusive Education, Inclusive Education Where There are Few Resources, Emerging Trends in Inclusive Education, and finally Inclusive Education in Low-Income Countries.

Definition of inclusion.

We started our thematic analysis by collecting and analyzing the definition of inclusion in each of our data sources. Inclusive education is interpreted as a method of recognizing and conceding to the diverse needs of all learners and thereby improving participation in learning and lessening exclusion within and from education (Losert, 2010). Learners who are observed to be ‘different’ are often eliminated or neglected in communities. For inclusion to occur the beliefs and strategies of the Lebanese community must be fixed so that these children can entirely and equally have a part in and participate in the life of their community and culture. Similarly, they say in the article titled “Inclusive Education” (2008) defines inclusion as a process that entails the conversion of schools and other centers of learning to cater to all children of different genders, from ethnic groups, those affected by illnesses, and those with disabilities and learning complications. “One significant consequence of differentiated curricular and institutional structures for students categorized as having special needs has been their segregation and isolation within the education system.” (“Inclusive Education” 2008, p.7). To illustrate, education systems need to perform inclusion sufficiently since they are encompassing major challenges of providing an effective approach to all children. “In the context of a broader vision

of integration, inclusive education implies the conception and the implementation of a vast repertoire of learning strategies to respond precisely to learners' diversities." ("Inclusive Education" 2008, p.9). But in this article Körner et al. (2007) define the term inclusive education illustrates the process of struggling for the inclusion of people with disabilities in the mainstream education system. This shows that inclusion is still being fought for and demanded to be applicable in many learning communities but still not taking a position.

Inclusion is a new concept in many countries (Mariga et al, 2014). In the article, Inclusive Education in Low-Income Countries (2014) inclusive education is defined as "the process which addresses and acknowledges the diverse needs of all students by improving student's involvement in the learning process and cultural and environmental activities bringing down exclusion within education". To further illustrate, the process also includes modification and adjustments of topics, approaches, and procedures with a typical vision that covers all learners of the proper age range and the conviction that it is the obligation of the regular system to teach all kids. This article uses the definition of Agra Seminar 1998 to define inclusive education and it states that it is much more extensive than normal schooling (formal schooling) since it involves the home, the community, non-formal and informal systems and it also states that all kids can learn. It is also mentioned that inclusive education is a dynamic process that is always changing and it is essential to promote an inclusive community.

Inclusive education is additionally defined as the dedication to involve learners with special educational needs in mainstream education by enhancing and modifying specific homeroom practices to the individual needs of the student (Coates and Vickerman 2008; de Boer, Pijl, and Minnaert 2010; Lindsay 2007), where learners are not only physically integrated, but also socially included. This is stated in the book Inclusive Education: where there are few

resources by Sue Stubbs and it states “Inclusion or inclusive education is not another name for ‘special needs education. It involves a different approach to identifying and attempting to resolve difficulties that arise in schools.... special needs education can be a barrier to the development of inclusive practice in schools.”

Rationale of inclusion

These different resources illustrate the rationale behind inclusive educations and why it is important to be implemented everywhere. According to Losert (2010), public awareness of cases of underprivileged children and children with disabilities is expanding and parents are frequently expressing their uncertainty about their children’s rights to sufficient education and maintenance. This is one of the main concepts behind the importance of inclusive education since disabled learners have the right to be educated with public policies should stand to enforce it.

Another policy’s primacy of inclusive education stated “Inclusion needs to be seen as a means of improving the quality of education for all learners in order to avoid the danger of inclusion being seen as something that does not concern the wider education system.” (“Inclusive Education” 2008, p.13). This explains the motive of why international systems are taking into consideration the implementation of inclusion between learners. It is mentioned that the importance of such an approach in educational systems may be an effective standpoint of the marginalized groups in society as a whole, or may be linked to an attempt to address issues of scarcity, illiteracy, and marginalization. Moreover, according to Körner et al. (2007) elucidates the liberty of all children to education, including children with intellectual disabilities has been increasingly perceived at international, European, and federal extents. The notion of inclusion in some countries is taken seriously into consideration by public authorities to help achieve the right for everyone whether with or without disabilities to be educated. “While the right of all

children to education has widespread recognition, the right to inclusive education is less well established legally.” (Körner et al., 2007, p.2). As contrasted by these researchers the rationale performed in some countries are opposed legally, while in a widespread recognition it is less recognized. This widespread recognition of the right to be educated, especially the right to inclusive education is less well established legally.

Those rules of inclusive education set by different international legal policies such as UNICEF, UNCRPD are implemented in some countries and not all since those approaches need financial support to take action. Thus, according to Sharma and Mahapatra (2007) not all countries can manifest in their educational programs. UNICEF on the other hand offer a slightly different perspective on this issue when they say “Inclusive education recognizes that all students can learn and respects differences and it also empowers the special needs students to develop their potential.” Teachers also found out that they gained from this process of IE: “I now enjoy teaching more. The program helped us with different teaching techniques for the so-called normal pupils; even after hours, we stay to prepare to cope with individual differences. I found that having knowledge of assessing strengths and weaknesses helps me to understand the students’ needs individually.” (“IE in countries” 2014, p.37). Many scholars point out the differences in what people say regarding what to do for inclusive education to succeed and what should be considered when implementing inclusive education. Sharma and Mahapatra (2007) suggest that special educational needs learners encounter benefits such as decreased rates of inappropriate behavior, increased rates of individual learning objectives achieved and improved skill acquisition, and increased friendships. Whereas the benefits for normal students are increased understanding, acceptance, and respect to diverse students and having opportunities to master skills by practicing and teaching others.

Creating inclusive education

Inclusive education includes practices that depend on how well the teacher is trained, the facilities, and the approach used in a school. “Best practices are based on evidence or research that demonstrates a strengthened education delivery system where children with disabilities have increased access, attendance, and achievement in education.” (Losert, 2010, p.9). These practices are done in schools that cater for inclusion are gathered from documentation and literature by international sources that recommend using them in inclusive communities. Furthermore, the practices cover many areas in inclusive educational approach, such as the policy framework, the program and services, the human capacity development and the performance outcomes. For example, a clear definition of inclusive education policy and regulation supporting universal rights is of equal entry and participation for all learners, implementation of general education’s best practices (such as active- student-centered learning, cooperative learning, peer support and more), ongoing training for professional development and finally needs-based assessment for student placement. Those practices exist from explorations and indications done on learners with special needs.

According to “INCLUSIVE EDUCATION.” (2008) state that a key strategy to support learning is implying peer support, teachers supporting each other, parents as associates in the education of their children, and communities as contributors of schools and other centers of learning. As such, inclusive education needs cooperation and collaboration between all members of the society to be effective and help students with special needs to feel included in the society. Teachers should be professionally trained for inclusive classrooms implementing the strategy of peer cooperation to nurture one another. In addition, society plays a main role in accepting one another and remain attentive to supporting the child’s growth rather than simply

labeling and ranking children. In their program, the author explains: “Special attention has to be paid to the methodological support and training of teachers so that the transition of mainstream schools towards inclusion can be as smooth and competent as possible, for school staff as well as for students.” (Körner et al., 2007, p.4). Teachers, school authorities, and other stakeholders entailed in the educational system can fulfill as useful resources in support of inclusion. Inclusive education is about enhancing learning settings but also about procuring alternatives for all learners to become prosperous in their learning experiences provided by their teachers. Thus, the teacher plays an essential role in the overall inclusive approach in schools depending on her professionalism and knowledge of inclusive practices. In *Inclusive Education in Low-Income Countries*, it is stated that “inclusive education aim in low-income countries was to be conscious of cultural norms and understand existing systems with an emphasis on helping educators to respond better to the recognized needs of kids, including discovering approaches and finding new ways to make the curriculum accessible to those with disabilities.” While the book “*Inclusive education: where there are few*” states that there is no blueprint for inclusive education but it shares three key ingredients that assist in making an inclusive program realistic and effective. The three ingredients are: Having a strong framework, implementation within the local context and culture, and ongoing participation and critical self-reflection.

In this section, we discussed and analyzed our findings. Most of the sources we found defined inclusion in the same way but each focused on a main aspect such as special needs rights, their schools, and how to normalize their presence in our communities. Furthermore, we found out that the ways in creating inclusive education varied on how it was applied but they all agreed on one key factor which was that cooperation between all members of the society is needed to create an inclusive education.

Methodology

In this research study, we used a qualitative research design that enables us to answer our research questions using the document analysis we conducted. The approach to our methodology is based on Merriam's (2009) guidance from her book called *Qualitative Research*. The qualitative research criterion interprets the procedures and strategies best adequate for compiling and investigating data. To summon the evidence desired we used a non-probabilistic purposeful sample of e-documents brought out from the internet. Furthermore, we utilized thematic analysis to support organizing our data, through a process of deductive coding. The different approaches to inclusive education topic was deducted from the original research question. Then, three themes were formed out of our main topic to form three deductive themes that are the definition of inclusion, the rationales of inclusion, and how to create inclusive programs.

A qualitative methodology is compiled since it pursues to comprehend a conveyed event from the people encountering it through textual explanations that can be interpreted for themes and provoke convenient understandings (Merriam, 2009). Moreover, we utilized researcher triangulation which is the discussion of the findings with one another before enforcing them in our research paper to increase the reliability of our findings. The research work was distributed equally in terms of scanning and searching for articles, then writing our findings. To further increase reliability, a discussion and interpretations of our findings were made before writing them down.

Discussion and conclusion

In this section, we will discuss the significance of our findings and offer implications for Inclusive early childhood education in Lebanon. After exploring early years' inclusive approaches from several databases, we were able to study the various inclusive points of view

that they offered. We compared how each inclusive approach in varied countries believed they were inclusive according to three main themes that are how they define inclusion, the rationales they have for inclusion, and how they think inclusion could be created. Almost all countries explored, leaned more to a child-centered inclusive approach. However, we found out that the strategies in creating inclusive education differed on how it pertained but they all acknowledged one key characteristic which was that cooperation between all members of the community is desired to create an inclusive education.

Inclusion in all countries is defined in the same way, many of the resources show that inclusion is present in approximately a big number of countries but implemented and understood differently. To illustrate, as seen in the study done in Kuwait, there are autistic children of mothers that have a vague understanding of their kids' special needs condition and the correct way of treating it. Such aspect refers to pointing out the appropriate way to accomplish practices and how to bring up awareness in people with kids of special needs. Furthermore, this compares to how many parents have an uncertain knowledge of their kids' special needs especially in Lebanon, which influences the schooling they are providing to their young in need learners. Moreover, the questionnaire answered by 300 teachers in Urban areas of Jordan, UAE, and the USA showed that teachers implied identical motives and qualities related to the equity that can be attained in the quality inclusive classroom. But had difficulties when it comes to practice since a gap was present between the theory of inclusive education and the existing practices applied. Due to financial matters, some countries like Lebanon do not invest quite much in the field of education, and inclusive education needs a huge investment to train teachers professionally and equip schools with appropriate facilities. Such aspect of inclusion should be performed and mandated in every school cause everyone should have the right to be educated. In

Lebanon many special needs kids are not getting the effective education needed for their development. Others are not getting any education due to the vague mentality their parents have about their cases claiming their kids' abilities are of thanks. To fix such issues in Lebanon, inclusion should take on all school's approaches to learning, for the upcoming community to normalized their presence and count them as a part of our community.

The pedagogy in Lebanon has primarily relied on other regions. And, even though various countries have surpassed and upgraded their curriculums, yet Lebanon still has not. We think that the best and fair approach in Lebanon for all students is the implementation of inclusive classrooms in public and private schools. Similar to the approaches and strategies performed by Thai's teacher. After teachers have been proficiently tutored to use this curriculum, we suggest that assigning this pedagogy to the Lebanese curriculum will govern to an upgrade in the development of children at a tremendous pace.

Limitations

Every study has its own limitations. However, several researchers are hesitant to talk about the limitations of their research in their articles. Our research would be more credible if we collected interviews from different school coordinators about how the approaches are being covered and how students are interacting. Interviews with schools that do not perform inclusion in their classrooms. Moreover, we should have used a more demanding research design to increase our research credibility. For instance, adding to the qualitative research done, a quantitative research of a large sample of various schools addressing the improvement of diverse students in academic performance when implementing inclusion and when not.

References:

Hollingsworth, H. L., & Buysse, V. (2009). Establishing friendships in early childhood inclusive settings: What roles do parents and teachers play? *Journal of Early intervention*, 31(4), 287-307.

Jie Zhu, Hui Li & Wu-Ying Hsieh (2019) Implementing inclusive education in an early childhood setting: a case study of a Hong Kong kindergarten, *Early Child Development and Care*, 189:2, 207-219, DOI: 10.1080/03004430.2017.1307841

Wu-Ying Hsieh & Chang-Ming Hsieh (2012) Urban early childhood teachers' attitudes towards inclusive education, *Early Child Development and Care*, 182:9, 1167-1184, DOI: 10.1080/03004430.2011.602191

Akrim, M., & Harfiani, R. (2019). Daily learning flow of inclusive education for early childhood. *Utopía y praxis latinoamericana: revista internacional de filosofía iberoamericana y teoría social*, (6), 132-141.

Yagata, S. (2019). Inclusive Education and Communication Impairment in Early Childhood: A Perspective from Japan. *Asia-Pacific journal of research in early childhood education*, 13(3).

Voss, J. A., & Bufkin, L. J. (2011). Teaching all children: Preparing early childhood preservice teachers in inclusive settings. *Journal of Early Childhood Teacher Education*, 32(4), 338-354.

Hamaidi, D., Homidi, M., & Reyes, L. V. (2012). International Views of Inclusive Education: A Comparative Study of Early Childhood Educator's Perceptions in Jordan, United Arab Emirates, and the United States of America. *International Journal of Special Education*, 27(2), 94-101.

Hilbert, D. (2014). Perceptions of Parents of Young Children with and without Disabilities Attending Inclusive Preschool Programs. *Journal of Education and Learning*, 3(4), 49-59.

Zabeli & Gjelaj, *Cogent Education* (2020), 7: 1791560, DOI: 10.1080/2331186X.2020.1791560

- Joseph S Agbenyega & Sunanta Klibthong (2014) Assessing Thai early childhood teachers' knowledge of inclusive education, *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 18:12, 1247-1261, DOI: 10.1080/13603116.2014.886306
- Tawanda Majoko (2018) Effectiveness of special and inclusive teaching in early childhood education in Zimbabwe, *Early Child Development and Care*, 188:6, 785-799, DOI: 10.1080/03004430.2016.1237514
- Jie Zhu, Hui Li & Wu-Ying Hsieh (2019) Implementing inclusive education in an early childhood setting: a case study of a Hong Kong kindergarten, *Early Child Development and Care*, 189:2, 207-219, DOI: 10.1080/03004430.2017.1307841
- Wu-Ying Hsieh & Chang-Ming Hsieh (2012) Urban early childhood teachers' attitudes towards inclusive education, *Early Child Development and Care*, 182:9, 1167-1184, DOI: 10.1080/03004430.2011.602191
- Zhang, L., Liu, X., & Lin, Y. (2019). Teachers' perception of the response to intervention implementation feasibility in Chinese inclusive early childhood education. *International Journal of Developmental Disabilities*, 65(5), 387-395.
- Soodak, L. C., & Erwin, E. J. (2000). Valued member or tolerated participant: Parents' experiences in inclusive early childhood settings. *Journal of the Association for persons with severe handicaps*, 25(1), 29-41.
- Khochen, M. & Radford, J (2016). Attitudes of teachers and headteachers towards inclusion in Lebanon. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*. 16(2), 139-153.
DOI:10.1080/13603111003671665
- Guralnick, M. J. & Bruder, M. B. (2016). Early Childhood Inclusion in the United States. *Infants & Young Children*, 29(3), 166-177. Doi: 10.1097/IYC.0000000000000071

Gine, C., Balcells-Balcells, A., Canadas, M. & Paniagua, G (2016). Early Childhood Inclusion in Spain. *Infants and Young Children*, 29(3), 223-230. Doi:10.1097/IYC.0000000000000068

Liao, H. & Wu, P. (2017). Early Childhood Inclusion in Taiwan. *Infant sand Young Children*, 30(4), 320-327. Doi:10.1097/IYC.0000000000000102

Appendices

Figure 1.

Resources Title	Abbreviation
Inclusive Education: the way of the future ¹	Inclusive Education
Inclusive education in low income countries	Inclusive education in countries

¹ <https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000180629>